

20 March 2014

Mr Stuart Harman Sovereign Wynyard Centre Pty Limited c/o Brookfield Office Properties GPO Box 172 SYDNEY NSW 2000

Our Ref: 13-0055mcc2

Re: Concept Plan Modification for Inclusion of 285–287 George Street, Sydney—Heritage Impact Assessment

Dear Mr Harman

We refer to the application to modify the Concept Plan approval (No. MP09\_0076) for the proposed One Carrington Street development to include 285–287 George Street, Sydney, within the proposed development site.

This letter provides a preliminary assessment of the potential impacts of the proposal on the heritage significance of the existing building at 285–287 George Street (Beneficial House) and recommendations for any future Development Application.

### **Background**

The building at 285–287 George Street, formerly known as Peapes Menswear and later Beneficial House, is listed as a heritage item on Schedule 5 of the *Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2012* (Sydney LEP 2012) as 'Former Commercial Building including interiors' (Item No. I765). It is also classified by the National Trust of Australia (NSW) as 'Beneficial House, formerly Peapes Store' (Listing ID: C6217). The building is not listed on the State Heritage Register, under the *Heritage Act 1977* (NSW).

The building was designed by Wilson, Neave & Berry for Peapes Menswear Company. It was completed in 1923. The building is Inter-War Commercial Palazzo style in form, with Georgian Revival details. When Peapes Menswear closed in 1970, the building was converted to offices, with retail retained on the ground floor.

In 2012, Concept Plan approval was granted for the One Carrington Street development, which comprises redevelopment of the Thakral House and Menzies Hotel sites (including refurbishment of the former Shell House, 2–12 Carrington Street).

### Heritage Significance

The State Heritage Inventory citation for 'Former Commercial Building including interiors' provides the following summary statement of significance for Beneficial House:

### Sydney Office

78 George Street Redfern NSW Australia 2016 T +61 2 9319 4811 F +61 2 9319 4383 E heritage@gml.com.au

### Canberra Office

2A Mugga Way Red Hill ACT Australia 2603 T +61 2 6273 7540 F +61 2 6273 8114 E heritage@gml.com.au

GML Heritage Pty Ltd ABN 60 001 179 362



Beneficial House is noteworthy for its former lengthy association with 'Peapes Menswear' (1923–1970), a particularly well-known Sydney retail store, and its contribution to creating an image for the store. It reflects the importance of George Street as a principal retailing thoroughfare and, generally, an important period of development during the 1920s. The building is of aesthetic significance as one of very few surviving commercial examples of Inter-war Georgian Revival style architecture and the work of Hardy Wilson. It is strikingly similar to British Airways House also attributed to Wilson, Neave & Berry, and has parallels with Lisgar House (refer No. 2004). It is a good example of the style and contributes significantly to the streetscape of George Street. The combination of Georgian Revival style in the brick facade, windows and section of tiled roof with a Commercial Palazzo style sandstone base adds to the architectural interest of the building.

The State Heritage Inventory citation also includes management guidelines for Beneficial House, as follows:

Given the level of significance of Beneficial House a Conservation Plan should be prepared to guide any future development proposals or maintenance works. The external form and scale of the building should be preserved. Exterior: Future development should preserve the George Street facade including timber multi-paned windows, tiled roof section and sandstone arcade (if evidence confirms that it is original). Interior: Any internal alterations to the ground floor should be preceded by an investigation of surviving original spatial characteristics, materials and finishes. These elements should be incorporated and missing elements restored, in future fit-out work. The extent of alterations to the upper floors allows scope for future adaptive re-use provided that no external alterations to George Street are required. The building should be retained and conserved. A Heritage Assessment and Heritage Impact Statement, or a Conservation Management Plan, should be prepared for the building prior to any major works being undertaken. There shall be no vertical additions to the building and no alterations to the façade of the building other than to reinstate original features. The principal room layout and planning configuration as well as significant internal original features including ceilings, cornices, joinery, flooring and fireplaces should be retained and conserved. Any additions and alterations should be confined to the rear in areas of less significance, should not be visibly prominent and shall be in accordance with the relevant planning controls.

A Conservation Management Plan (CMP) was prepared for the building by Graham Brooks and Associates for Kapau Holdings Pty Ltd in 2004, for a development proposal that did not proceed. GML has reviewed the CMP in preparing this preliminary Heritage Impact Assessment. We are of the opinion that it would be sufficient to guide any proposed changes to the building as part of the proposed One Carrington Street development and also for submission with the future One Carrington Street Development Application.

The 1992 Central Sydney Archaeological Zoning Plan (AZP) identifies 285–287 George Street (Beneficial House) as an area of Archaeological Potential—Partially Disturbed (AAP–PD).

### **Description of the Proposal**

The Environmental Assessment Report (JBA 2014) provides the following description of the proposal:

In order to incorporate 285 George Street into the Concept Plan, and to integrate the further refinements to the Concept Plan that came about through the design excellence process, a second modification to the Concept Plan is required.

Accordingly this modification application (herein referred to as Concept Plan (Mod 2)) seeks approval for:

- Inclusion of 285 George Street, Sydney and an area above Wynyard Lane, within the Concept Plan site.
- An increase in the maximum GFA proportionate to that permissible on 285 George Street and provision for end of
  journey floor space to be excluded from the calculation of GFA.
- Expansion of the Concept Plan Envelope to provide for a tower cantilever over 285 George Street and an additional area of Wynyard Lane.



- Retention of Wynyard Lane as a one way street.
- An increase in the maximum tenant car spaces proportionate to that permissible on 285 George Street.

It is noted that Concept Plan (Mod 2) has been lodged concurrently with the State Significant Development Application for the detailed design and construction of Stage 1 of the Concept Plan.

### **Heritage Impact Assessment**

The proposal has the potential to have the following heritage impacts:

- impacts on the setting of Beneficial House from the proposed tower which will have a cantilever component above the item's roofline;
- impacts on the fabric and internal spatial character of the lower four storeys (including basement)
   of Beneficial House from the opening up of its southern boundary wall to connect the building at the lower levels with the One Carrington Street development; and
- impacts on the internal fabric of Beneficial House from the proposed refurbishment works as part of the One Carrington Street development.

The proposed cantilever section of the One Carrington Street tower will be set three storeys above the roof of Beneficial House, and set back 14m from its George Street facade. The cantilever would be visible in longer views of Beneficial House and its broader setting; however, the proposed setbacks for the cantilever will still allow the three-dimensional form of Beneficial House to be interpreted in views to its principal elevation from George and Hunter Streets.

The interior spaces of Beneficial House have undergone substantial change since the 1970s, resulting in little extant original fabric other than the structure, one lift shaft and potentially some of the fire stair fabric (originally an open staircase in the Peapes Menswear store). Removal of recent internal fabric, including the 1970s mezzanine level, ground floor shop fit-outs and office partitions on all floors, would allow the original open space of the building's individual floors to be revealed. This would be positive in terms of removing intrusive fabric and allowing fabric and spaces of greater significance (such as the original windows and remaining window joinery) to be revealed.

Integration of Beneficial House with the One Carrington Street development at the lower four storeys (including basement) would result in the loss of some original fabric and has the potential to compromise the spatial integrity of the lower levels of Beneficial House. Design measures such as ensuring that any opening of the building's southern wall is set back from the George Street façade and maintaining a turnback section of the original brick wall would assist in providing a clear visual separation between the internal space of Beneficial House and the One Carrington Street development, as well as between the significant facade of Beneficial House and that of the new development. The proposal would also provide opportunities for other parts of the southern boundary wall to be revealed.

In summary, the proposed works to Beneficial House as part of the Concept Plan modification for the One Carrington Street project are in accordance with the State Heritage Inventory management guidelines for Beneficial House.

### **Conclusions and Recommendations**

Overall, the proposal has the potential to have a minor adverse impact on the heritage significance of Beneficial House. This impact could be mitigated through careful, sympathetic design and



implementation of mitigation measures such as conservation works to significant fabric, photographic archival recording and interpretation.

We make the following recommendations for mitigating impacts on Beneficial House in the One Carrington Street development and future Development Application:

- The policies of the 2004 CMP should be used to guide any changes proposed to Beneficial House and to ensure that the development conserves the heritage significance of the building. The CMP should also be submitted with any future Development Application for One Carrington Street to meet the recommended management guidelines provided in the building's heritage listing.
- A detailed Heritage Impact Statement should be prepared to assess the impact of the proposed One Carrington Street Development Application design on the heritage significance of Beneficial House.
- The Heritage Impact Statement should include recommendations for mitigating any heritage impacts on Beneficial House that may result from the proposal, including guidance for conserving significant fabric, archival recording, and recommendations for interpretation.
- Advice from a suitably qualified heritage architect/consultant should be incorporated into the
  detailed design of the proposed alterations and conservation works for Beneficial House and its
  relationship to the One Carrington Street tower, particularly its integration at the lower levels and
  the proposed cantilever.
- Opportunities for restoring significant fabric and features should be pursued in the detailed design.
   Conservation of significant fabric should be included in the One Carrington Street development.

An Archaeological Assessment is being prepared for the whole One Carrington Street development site, including Beneficial House, to meet the DGRs for the approved Concept Plan. However, no excavation is currently proposed within the Beneficial House site.

Please do not hesitate to contact me if you have any queries about this advice.

Yours sincerely GML Heritage Pty Ltd

Skor

Peter Romey Partner

### Attachments:

NSW State Heritage Inventory citation for Beneficial House



You are here: Home > Heritage sites > Searches and directories > NSW heritage

search

### Former Commercial Building Including Interiors

### Item details

Name of item: Former Commercial Building Including Interiors
Other name/s: Peapes MeNSWear Store, Beneficial House

Type of item: Built

**Group/Collection:**Retail and Wholesale **Category:** Department Store

**Location:** Lat: -33.8671196344376 Long: 151.205872552492

Primary address: 285-287 George Street, Sydney, NSW 2000

Local govt. area: Sydney

### All addresses

Street Address	Suburb/town	LGA	Parish	County	Туре
285-287 George Street	Sydney	Sydney			Primary Address

### Statement of significance:

Beneficial House is noteworthy for its former lengthy association with "Peapes Menswear" (1923-1970), a particularly well-known Sydney retail store, and its contribution to creating an image for the store. It reflects the importance of George Street as a principal retailing thoroughfare and, generally, an important period of development during the 1920s. The building is of aesthetic significance as one of very few surviving commercial examples of Inter-war Georgian Revival style architecture and the work of Hardy Wilson. It is strikingly similar to British Airways House also attributed to Wilson, Neave & Berry, and has parallels with Lisgar House (refer no 2004). It is a good example of the style and contributes significantly to the streetscape of George Street. The combination of Georgian Revival style in the brick facade, windows and section of tiled roof with a Commercial Palazzo style sandstone base adds to the architectural interest of the building.

### Date significance updated: 03 Jan 06

Note: There are incomplete details for a number of items listed in NSW. The Heritage Branch intends to develop or upgrade statements of significance and other information for these items as resources become available.

### **Description**

Designer/Maker:Wilson, Neave & Berry (Hardy Wilson)

**Builder/Maker:** Unknown **Construction** 1923-1923

years:

**Physical description:**Beneficial House is a seven storey load bearing brick building originally designed as a department store and

offices by Hardy Wilson, of Wilson, Neave & Berry, in the

1 of 5

Inter-War Georgian Revival style with a Commercial Palazzo form. Wilson, Neave & Berry were one of the skilled exponents of this rare style in Sydney. The detailing and glazing is Georgian Revival. The ground floor has five stone arches while the rest of the façade is plain with multi-paned timber framed windows. Second floor windows have semi-circular fanlights. Commercial Palazzo devices are utilised such as a stone base, office floors with simple brickwork and fenestration, and a top that is terminated by a projecting cornice. The ground floor interiors feature decorative plaster ceilings with timber panelled walls and columns. The upper level offices have been heavily modified with plasterboard stud walls and suspended acoustic ceiling tiles. Category:Individual building. Style:Inter-War Georgian Revival, Commercial Palazzo form. Storeys:7 + basement. Façade:Face brick, sandstone cladding, alumin./glass shopfront. Side/Rear Walls: Face brick. Internal Walls: Plasterbd. And stud, timber and stud, marble facing. Roof Cladding:Terracotta tiles, waterproof membrane. Internal Structure:Loadbearing walls and conc. Beams. Floor: Reinf. Conc. Slab, carpet, terrazzo, sandstone, timber. Roof:Reinf. Conc. Slab, timber framing. Ceilings: Susp. Acoustic tiles, decorative plaster. Stairs: Reinf. Conc. Stairs, carpet over treads, decorative timber balustrade; Reinf. Conc. Stair, steel balustrade and handrail.. Fire Stairs:1. Sprinkler System:Yes. Lifts:2, AirConditioned: Yes original timber panelled lift cars, new mechanics.

**Physical** condition and/or **Archaeological** potential:

In general, the exterior and ground floor interior of Beneficial House remain intact although new office walls have been introduced. Upper floor offices have been extensively altered and limited original detail remains. The brickwork facing George Street is distinctive. Intrusive Elements: Modern fitouts to upper floors comprising partitions and suspended ceilings.

Date condition updated:07 Dec 05

**Modifications** and dates:

1923

**Further** information:

High Significance: External building form, scale and facade to George Street including multi-paned windows and tiled roof. Medium Significance: Ground floor interiors retaining original integrity, load bearing masonry walls, concrete floors and beams. Was a heritage item in 1989, and remains so to the present.

Heritage Inventory sheets are often not comprehensive, and should be regarded as a general guide only. Inventory sheets are based on information available, and often do not include the social history of sites and buildings. Inventory sheets are constantly updated by the City as further information becomes available. An inventory sheet with little information may simply indicate that there has been no building work done to the item recently: it does not mean that items are not significant. Further research is always recommended as part of preparation of development proposals for heritage items, and is necessary in preparation of Heritage Impact Assessments and Conservation Management Plans, so that the significance of heritage items can be fully assessed prior to submitting development applications.

Current

Retail, commercial offices

use:

Former use: Commercial offices, retail

2 of 5 19/03/2014 10:10 AM

### **History**

## Historical notes:

The "Eora people" was the name given to the coastal Aborigines around Sydney. Central Sydney is therefore often referred to as "Eora Country". Within the City of Sydney local government area, the traditional owners are the Cadigal and Wangal bands of the Eora. There is no written record of the name of the language spoken and currently there are debates as whether the coastal peoples spoke a separate language "Eora" or whether this was actually a dialect of the Dharug language. Remnant bushland in places like Blackwattle Bay retain elements of traditional plant, bird and animal life, including fish and rock oysters.

With the invasion of the Sydney region, the Cadigal and Wangal people were decimated but there are descendants still living in Sydney today. All cities include many immigrants in their population. Aboriginal people from across the state have been attracted to suburbs such as Pyrmont, Balmain, Rozelle, Glebe and Redfern since the 1930s. Changes in government legislation in the 1960s provided freedom of movement enabling more Aboriginal people to choose to live in Sydney.

(Information sourced from Anita Heiss, "Aboriginal People and Place", Barani: Indigenous History of Sydney City http://www.cityofsydney.nsw.gov.au/barani)

In 1922, an application was made for the construction of new business premises, 47' x 92', at 285-287 George Street. The design was prepared by Hardy Wilson of Wilson, Neave and Berry. The building was occupied by Peapes Menswear between 1923-70. The interior of the building was particularly impressive making extensive use of maple and jarrah. The floors originally consisted of a series of mezzanines around a circular light well. During its use as a department store few alterations were recorded, principally changes to the shopfront in 1966 and what may have been the partial infill of a light well in 1954. In 1970 the building was acquired by Equity Property Management Ltd. and Beaver Properties and in 1971 by the Permanent Building Society Ltd. In this year Gergely and Pinter made an application to carry out extensive alterations and a refurbishment to create offices and a restaurant. For the remainder of the 1970s-80s the principal works encompassed the reassignment of space through partitions. In 1980 alterations were made to the ground floor.

### **Historic themes**

Australian theme (abbrev)	New South Wales theme	Local theme
3. Economy-Developing local, regional and national economies	Commerce-Activities relating to buying, selling and exchanging goods and services	(none)-

### **Assessment of significance**

# SHR Criteria a) [Historical significance]

Beneficial House is noteworthy for its former lengthy association with a prominent retailer, Peapes Menswear, between 1923 and 1970. The location of the building reflects the prominence of George Street as a retail precinct and, generally an important period of development in the 1920s. It is significant as a rare work of Hardy Wilson in a city context.

## SHR Criteria c) [Aesthetic significance]

Beneficial House is a fine example of Inter-war Georgian Revival architecture with Commercial Palazzo style

3 of 5

elements including the sandstone arcaded base. It created an appropriate image for an exclusive menswear department store. The building retains its architectural qualities intact with multi-paned timber framed windows and tiled roof section. It is an important contributor to the streetscape of George Street.

SHR Criteria d) Beneficial House has had a long association with a [Social significance] prominent menswear store. Its position is demonstrative of the area as a retail centre in the city. Has social significance locally. Beneficial House is a fine example of Inter-war Georgian Revival architecture with Commercial Palazzo style elements including the sandstone arcaded base. It created an appropriate image for an exclusive menswear department store. The building retains its architectural qualities intact with multi-paned timber framed windows and tiled roof section. It is an important contributor to the streetscape of George Street.

### SHR Criteria f)

[Rarity]

Beneficial House is one of a limited number of Georgian Revival commercial buildings of the Inter-war period to survive. Grenville House at 177-185 William Street, British Airways House (2045) and Lisgar House (2004) are possibly the only other buildings of this type and style to remain. As such it is a rare and architecturally distinguished example of an unusual building style often attributed to the firm of Wilson, Neave and Berry.

### **SHR Criteria g)** Beneficial House represents the importance of George

[Representativeness]Street as the principal retailing thoroughfare in the city centre. It is representative of the former associations with the prominent retailer, Peapes Menswear.

### Assessment criteria:

Items are assessed against the 🔁 State Heritage Register (SHR) Criteria to determine the level of significance. Refer to the Listings below for the level of statutory protection.

### Recommended management:

Given the level of significance of Beneficial House a Conservation Plan should be prepared to guide any future development proposals or maintenance works. The external form and scale of the building should be preserved. Exterior: Future development should preserve the George Street facade including timber multi-paned windows, tiled roof section and sandstone arcade (if evidence confirms that it is original). Interior: Any internal alterations to the ground floor should be preceded by an investigation of surviving original spatial characteristics, materials and finishes. These elements should be incorporated and missing elements restored, in future fitout work. The extent of alterations to the upper floors allows scope for future adaptive re-use provided that no external alterations to George Street are required. The building should be retained and conserved. A Heritage Assessment and Heritage Impact Statement, or a Conservation Management Plan, should be prepared for the building prior to any major works being undertaken. There shall be no vertical additions to the building and no alterations to the façade of the building other than to reinstate original features. The principal room layout and planning configuration as well as significant internal original features including ceilings, cornices, joinery, flooring and fireplaces should be retained and conserved. Any additions and alterations should be confined to the rear in areas of less significance, should not be visibly prominent and shall be in accordance with the relevant planning controls.

### Listings

Heritage Listing Listing	Listing	Gazette	Gazette	Gazette	
--------------------------	---------	---------	---------	---------	--

19/03/2014 10:10 AM 4 of 5

	Title	Number	Date	Number	Page
Local Environmental Plan	Sydney LEP 2012	I1765	14 Dec 12		
Heritage study					

References, internet links & images

Туре	Author	Year	Title	Internet Links
Written			'Peapes Useful and Appreciable Gifts', Mitchell Lib. 658.87105/1, (text).	
Written			Council Records (Bas, Das)	
Written			Building, p51, Nov. 12 1923, (journal).	
Written	Anita Heiss		Aboriginal People and Place, Barani: Indigenous History of Sydney City	
Written	Australian Heritage Commission		National Estate Register listing sheet	
Written	National Trust (NSW)		National Trust listing sheet	
Written	Tanner & Cox,		Architecture in Australia Tanner & Cox, 'Architecture of Australia', (text).	

Note: internet links may be to web pages, documents or images.



### (Click on thumbnail for full size image and image details)

### **Data source**

The information for this entry comes from the following source:

Name: Local Government

**Database** 2423764

number:

Return to previous page

Every effort has been made to ensure that information contained in the State Heritage Inventory is correct. If you find any errors or omissions please send your comments to the <a href="Database Manager">Database Manager</a>.

All information and pictures on this page are the copyright of the Heritage Branch or respective copyright owners.

5 of 5 19/03/2014 10:10 AM