

6.0 DESCRIPTION OF DEVELOPMENT

6.1 GENERAL DESCRIPTION

The proposed development incorporates the refurbishment of Wynyard Station Concourse and platforms, which will be funded by Thakral Holdings Group, as part of a proposal to construct a multi storey tower with offices over Wynyard Station ramps, incorporating the former Shell House.

In Section 7 of this report the potential impacts and the features of the Concept Plan application that affect the heritage significance of items on the site and in the vicinity must form part of the consideration to be given under State Environmental Planning Policy (Major Projects) 2005 and State Environmental Planning Policy (Infrastructure) 2007. The site and its surroundings are also discussed in relation to the relevant provisions of Central Sydney Local Environmental Plan 2005, and Central Sydney Development Control Plan 1996. City of Sydney Heritage Development Control Plan, 2006 in general applies more broadly to the City of Sydney Local Government Area and not specifically to the City Centre.

Due to the scale of the development and its relationship to Railway infrastructure it is proposed that it be identified as a State significant project, for which the Minister for Planning will become the consent authority.

The Concept Plan application includes conceptual drawings prepared by Hassell architects depicting the form of scale of an indicative development comprising:

- Demolition of the existing buildings which comprise the development site with the exception of former Shell House, and Wynyard Station Platforms and tunnels.
- Major works to Wynyard Station concourse, including upgrades to:
 - the concourse layout, railway station entries and circulation thoroughfares (from George Street through to York Street) to “declutter” the space and extend the paid area.
 - disabled persons access;
 - the station facilities, ticketing areas, services and lifts; and
 - fire and life safety systems to the upper and lower platforms.
 - improve ventilation and smoke clearance.
 - add egress stairs from each end of platforms 3 and 4 and 5 and 6 discharging in Wynyard Park on the York Street border adjacent to the existing vent shafts.
 - where possible, to reveal the original coffered concrete soffits with uplighters above the concourse.
- A new 29 storey office building on the land between Carrington Street and George Street.
- Conservation works to former Shell House and its internal refurbishment for use as office premises.
- Five levels of retail linking George Street and Carrington Street to the Station concourse.
- Retention of the existing basement public car park located partly on the site and partly in disused tram tunnels.
- Construction of associated tenant basement parking.
- The upgrade of the public domain surrounding the site and associated public domain improvements.
- Upgraded station entry in Wynyard Park.

The Concept Plan will seek approval for:

- the building envelope (above and below ground);
- a floor space area (FSA) of approximately 85,000m²;
- all land uses;
- pedestrian and vehicle access arrangements;
- potential connections with the proposed CBD Metro station and Barangaroo Development Site; and
- car parking numbers.

6.2 FORMER SHELL HOUSE, 2 – 12 CARRINGTON STREET

The concept plan incorporates the Former Shell House into the commercial office space in the following manner:

- The external envelope, including the clock tower, will be retained and conservation works will be undertaken.
- The outer structural bays on Carrington and Margaret Street and Wynyard Lane will be retained with structural intervention to maintain a stable frame to support the external envelope during the excavation and construction process.
- To achieve an efficient floor plate, the existing lifts will be removed and a new lift and service core will be positioned on the south east corner of the floor plan.
- The area below the building will be excavated after support structure has been put in place for the retained elements of the building above. The excavation is proposed to accommodate a spiral ramp to access parking below the new building to the south and two substations, rainwater storage tanks and miscellaneous plant.
- At the Wynyard Lane level, penetrations will be made south of the point where the tiled facings return onto the eastern façade for an entry to the car park ramp and loading docks for offices, retail and Railcorp.
- At ground level within the former Shell House the space will also connect to the south to the main lobby for the proposed office tower structure.
- At levels 01 to 10 the office spaces within the new building and within the former Shell House can be contiguous. The existing floor levels of Shell House will be retained with new structure and the transitions to the floor levels of the new building will be resolved by ramp systems in the area immediately to the south of Shell House
- At floor 10 an additional office level is to be created at the present roof level of the former Shell House with the walls set back from the high parapet on the west and north sides so that the new level will not be seen from York Street, Margaret Street or Wynyard Park. . A lift motor room and plant spaces, if required, will be arranged at an additional level set even further back on the eastern side and below the critical site lines.
- The new building on the site of The Menzies Hotel will be built to the Carrington Street frontage. The junction between the façade of the former Shell House and the podium element will be expressed by a vertically articulated form corresponding to the main entry to the overall complex from Carrington Street.
- The façade will also come to the Street frontage alignment adjacent to Lisgar House in Carrington Street and Beneficial House in George Street. The junction with these heritage items will also be affected by an articulated treatment of the new building.
- The upper part at Level 10 in the former Shell House will utilise the existing parapet with its rectangular openings as a screen with the glazed wall of an office level set back. Future detailed design and documentation of the project will include restoration of the glazed terra cotta façade elements and conservation of the clock tower.

- New lift over runs and plant may be required above the new south eastern service and circulation core. This type of structure would be set so far back that it would not have an adverse visual impact in views to Shell House from the public domain.

6.3 WYNYARD PARK

At the Carrington Street level the existing entrances will be retained in principle but reconfigured. To the north and south there will be no disturbance to tree root systems and the grassed area will be maintained.

At the Park, on the York Street level, new escalators will provide access down to the concourse level. A lift will also serve this level for access by disabled persons. A rectangular opening sheltered by a lightly framed open glass canopy, set under the tree leaf canopy level, will allow a line of sight down to the upper concourse level (Wynyard Lane level) admitting light and assisting ventilation of the areas below. The detailed design of the canopy, the edges, the extent of the opening and the details of adjacent retail and plant areas at Carrington Street level will be undertaken in the next stages of the project. However, proposed changes will greatly improve upon the present situation by maximising the transparency of the new structure to provide vistas north and south the length of the Park.

6.4 WYNYARD STATION AND FORMER TRAM TUNNELS

With regard to the elements of primary significance the concept plan proposes that there will be no physical impacts at all. The existing platform configurations will not be altered and the surviving 1932 stair elements will be retained.

The concept design includes indicative layouts of the station areas to a reasonably high level of detail, including the access to and from ground level at George Street, York Street and Wynyard Park. The concourse areas, which, due to the extensive changes over time, retain little evidence of the original 1930s design intent and are of low significance aesthetically and technically, will be upgraded to achieve functionality and design quality befitting one of Sydney's major transport interchanges in a manner much more appropriate to meet the needs of the 21st century. This process will largely retain the 1930s structural elements of steel beams and columns and floor levels in the areas under Carrington Street, Wynyard Park and York Street. The major changes to create better access, reactivate Wynyard Lane and create a more open well ventilated public concourse and retail facilities will be made where little or no 1930s fabric remains; eg the area between George Street and Carrington Street; and the area where, in 1995, access was created from Wynyard Park down to the concourse. The proposed more open access in this area will remove an accumulation of clutter and somewhat convoluted series of escalators creating a greatly improved interface between the park and the station.

7.0 ASSESSMENT OF IMPACTS

7.1 PREAMBLE

The following assessment in Section 8 has been formatted to address conservation policies in the Conservation Management Plan, prepared by HBO+EMTB Heritage Pty Ltd where relevant to the Former Shell House 2-12 Carrington Street. The Concept Plan application and subsequent planning approvals process will come under and the provisions of Part 3A of the Environmental Planning and Assessment Act, 1979 and the Director General's requirements. The Sydney City Council's planning controls are discussed here for the purposes of evaluating the likely heritage impacts at the Concept Plan level. Detailed resolution of both heritage and urban design issues will be assessed later with the benefit of a detailed project application(s).

7.2 CENTRAL SYDNEY LOCAL ENVIRONMENT PLAN 2005 (CSLEP 2005)

This plan identifies requirements for development affecting items of Environmental Heritage. The structure at No. 2-12 Carrington Street, the former Shell House, is identified as heritage item No. 46, Railway House is item 418 in Schedule 8 and Wynyard Park as landscape/archaeological item 8084 in schedule 8, hence developments incorporating a heritage item or affecting a streetscape, ie: would be required to comply with this plan. The relevant clauses of Sydney Local Environment Plan 2005 relating to the proposal are, Clauses 67 - 76.

Clause 68 of CSLEP 2005 requires consent for development affecting heritage items as the consequent works will involve additions and alterations to No. 2-12 Carrington Street, the former Shell House, Railway House and demolition and structural alterations affecting Wynyard Park, all heritage items.

"The following development may be carried out only with development consent"

- a) demolition of a heritage item or a building in a heritage streetscape;
- b) structural or non-structural alterations to the exterior of a heritage item;
- c) structural or non structural alterations to the exterior of a building in a heritage streetscape that is not a heritage item; or
- d) erection of a sign or advertising structure on a heritage item; or
- e) erection of a building on the site of a heritage item or building in a heritage streetscape; or
- f) subdivision of a heritage item;

Clause 69 of CSLEP 2005 sets out matters the consent authority must consider in relation to the potential impact of the proposal;

"The consent authority must not grant consent to a development application involving a heritage item unless it has taken into consideration:

- a) the heritage significance of the heritage item concerned; and
- b) the extent to which the carrying out of the proposed development would affect the heritage significance of the heritage item, and any historic subdivision pattern in the locality; and
- c) the heritage inventory assessment report prepared in relation to the heritage item; and,
- d) any conservation management plan or heritage impact statement required by the consent authority; and
- e) any plan of management required by the consent authority; and,
- f) the provisions of any relevant development control plan adopted by the Council, and,
- g) the heritage significance of the interiors of any heritage Item concerned.

As previously stated, the Concept Plan proposal incorporates two heritage items; the former Shell House and Wynyard Park. The assessed heritage significance of Shell House identifies the building's historic and social significance in relation to the Shell Oil Co. and external aesthetic character as a distinguished example of the work of the architectural firm, Spain and Cosh, a prominent architectural practice of the period, executed in the Interwar Commercial Palazzo style, and rare for its use of glazed terra cotta tile facings and details. Wynyard Park has historical significance for its social and historic importance as an open space, which has continued to be used as public space since 1789, although it has been through several major transformations.

The Concept Plan proposal identifies building envelopes which will physically impact on the heritage items. However, physical changes affecting the existing significant external envelope up to parapet level at No. 2-12 Carrington Street will only affect the less significant exterior fabric on the east façade where a lift and service core is to be inserted and an opening made for vehicular access from Wynyard Lane. The envelope shows there is scope for additional accommodation behind and set back from the high parapet as long as it is not visible from public areas in Wynyard Park, York Street and Margaret Street. The RLs and setbacks necessary to achieve this requirement and conform to the Conservation Policies within the Conservation Management Plan for the former Shell House, 2-12 Carrington Street, Sydney are subject to further detailed investigation. To the extent any plant structure over the new eastern service and circulation core might be visible at all, it would have minimal visual impact.

Nevertheless, care should be taken with the extent of work that follows, firstly during the construction of lower levels below the existing structure, ensuring the heritage item envelope retains structural integrity, and to ensure work to the roof area does not negatively impact on the clock tower, allowing the existing building's parapet to be read against the skyline, without new works adversely disrupting views of the building's silhouette from within Wynyard Park or from York Street or Margaret Street.

The Concept Plan proposal identifies the potential bulk and scale of the proposed development arising from consolidation of a number of sites. As a result, the building envelope encapsulates a portion of Wynyard Lane which will modify the spatial perception but maintain Wynyard Lane as an activated thoroughfare. Continued use of the thoroughfare will retain the significance of service lanes as important elements in the Sydney street patterns.

Clause 70, defines the term **"materially affects"** in relation to development on land that comprises heritage items as a result of modifying existing building envelopes. No. 2-12 Carrington Street (No.46, CSHI No. 2003) will be *"materially affected"* although, the proposed new levels below the Basement level or the proposed additional floor on the roof will not affect the significance of the building and its exterior presence. This matter is discussed in more detail in Section 8 of this statement.

It may be said that the proposed renewal of the railway concourse extending into Wynyard Park creates potential to materially affect the park. Measures can be taken to ensure that the design of a structure responding to this envelope can mitigate any likely visual impacts, which is discussed further in Section 9.

Clause 71, restricts the maximum Floor Space Ratio (FSR) permitted on sites that are listed within Schedule 8 of the CSLEP 2005. It is understood the proposed development is within the permissible FSR for the site involved and it is not proposed to apply for heritage floor space for the purposes of the development.

Clause 72, makes an exception for heritage items of that may be *"materially affected"* if the proposed development meets certain tests:

- a) *"the item, or the part of the item affected, is not of such heritage significance or landmark value that the proposed development would diminish the heritage of the city of Sydney, and*

\\Alpha\heritage\Projects\280121 City one\O - Design\O2 SITE ANALYSIS\1) Reports\HIS\101012 Concept Plan HIS revision.doc © HBO+EMTB 2005	Date: 12/10/10		C FINAL	Page 42
--	-------------------	--	------------	---------

- b) *The proposed development exhibits design excellence and is superior in quality to the existing heritage item, and*
- c) *The proposed development would make a contribution to the quality of the public domain of the City of Sydney superior to that made by the existing heritage item, and*
- c) *In the case of partial demolition, the proposed development would conserve the heritage significance (and would not prejudice the continued heritage status) of the item; would facilitate its continued use or adaptive re use, and would contribute to ongoing conservation of the heritage item, or the affected part of the item that will be retained, and*
- e) *In the case of complete demolition, the retention of the heritage item would render the site on which it is located incapable of viable continued use or adaptive re use.*

The former Shell House, No.2-12 Carrington Street, is recognised as a heritage item with streetscape qualities, as noted in the Conservation Management Plan prepared by HBO+EMTB Heritage Pty Ltd. However, the extent of the changes that would be made to the exterior is minimal as constrained by the proposed Concept Plan building envelope and therefore will not diminish its heritage significance. Physical fabric that would be affected at the roof level and the east elevation has been rated as having a lower level of significance. Visual impacts on the public domain will be controlled by sight lines from vantage points in Wynyard Park, York Street and Margaret Street to the western and northern parapet line.

Clause 73, identifies the need for a process whereby the consent authority appoints a committee if the following major changes affect a heritage item.

- a) *“demolition that will result in a reduction by more than 35% of the building envelope;*
- b) *increasing the size of the building envelope by more than 20%;*
- c) *building over more than 20% of the footprint of the building envelope within the airspace above that item, but not within the airspace contiguous with the item.”*

The proposed additional level to the former Shell House as identified in the Concept Plan application will increase the building envelope by enabling construction of one level set back and concealed behind the high parapet, which would occupy more than 20% of the building footprint. The additional space potential would however, be much less than 20% of the size of the building envelope. Therefore, although under the CSLEP there may be a technical requirement for the consent authority to establish a committee specifically to examine or advise on the merits of the application, it is considered that this step would not be warranted because there would not be an adverse impact on the heritage significance of former Shell House, 2-12 Carrington Street in terms of its contribution to the streetscape and special character of the locality.

Clause 74, identifies the need to assess the potential impact of a development proposal, on the heritage items in the immediate vicinity, which includes; Railway House; Scots Church and Assembly Hall, in Margaret Street; Lisgar House (30-32 Carrington Street); Beneficial House (285-287 George Street); and Skinner’s Family Hotel (296 George Street) with regard their assessed significance, in particular aesthetic and townscape qualities, and whether they would be adversely affected visually or physically.

The envelope defined by the Concept Plan application will not affect heritage items immediately adjacent provided care is taken in the detailed design where new works abut and are seen against the existing buildings. The junctions at new built forms with Lisgar House, 30-32 Carrington Street, Beneficial House, 285-287 George Street (and also the former Shell House 2-12 Carrington Street) can be addressed by careful attention to the detailed relationship of the new facades by vertical articulation of the junction as indicated in the Concept Plan drawings.

Clause 75 identifies the need for an archaeological assessment for developments that may affect potential archaeological sites. Wynyard Park is identified as an item of archaeological/townscape/landscape in Schedule 8 of the Central Sydney Environment Plan, 2005.

The site for the proposed development has been extensively and deeply excavated for construction of this part of the city rail system and archaeological issues involving pre European occupation or below ground artefacts of European occupation are unlikely to arise.

7.3 CENTRAL SYDNEY DEVELOPMENT CONTROL PLAN, 1996 CSDCP 1996,

This assessment has given regard to the relevant provisions of CSDCP 1996. The DCP contains a number of provisions that relate to the envelope of the Stage One application and recognition of the identified heritage items in the immediate vicinity, as noted below:

Section 2.2 – Street Frontage Heights - this clause establishes the need for street frontages to have a minimum of 20m and a maximum of 45, ensuring the early character and scale of Sydney's streetscape and its heritage items are maintained.

The Concept Plan establishes a building envelope with a number of street frontages to George, Carrington, and Margaret Streets.

The street elevation of the face of the proposed tower along George Street does not have podium element not exceeding 45 metres at street frontage, but acknowledges the juxtaposition with (Beneficial House) by creation of an articulated junction.

Along Margaret Street the proposed envelope is within the existing building envelope at No. 2-12 Carrington Street. Due to the incline of Margaret Street, the street frontage height varies by almost a floor level. No. 2-12 Carrington Street returns to face Carrington Street, where the street frontage height will be set to the parapet level of the former Shell House slightly exceeding 45 metres from street level of RL 18.60. The extra volume contained behind the parapet therefore will cause no impact to the existing street frontage of No.2-12 Carrington Street along Margaret Street or Carrington Street.

The tower envelope comes to the street alignment along Carrington Street without the device of a setback from a podium form. Here too the junctions with the former Shell House and Lisgar House will be treated as an articulation in the tower form creating a clear distinction between the new and the old. This treatment at Shell House will be reinforced by the transparency of the link element between Shell House and the new building itself, which corresponds to the transition zone at the main entry at ground level and the ramped connections between the existing Shell House floor levels and the floor levels of the new building.

Section 2.3 – Building Setbacks, this requirement applies to new development and identifies the minimum and maximum setbacks which will affect the building envelope.

The proposed development does not propose setbacks above the street frontage alignments, choosing to respect the streetscape presence of the adjacent heritage items by creation of vertical articulation where the new building abuts. It is considered that in the context of Central Sydney, this approach carefully resolved in detailed design would produce a satisfactory outcome.

Section 2.9 – Extension to Heritage Items- refers to the vertical extension of heritage items prohibiting additional levels where the building is of such significance as to warrant retention in its present form; and otherwise requiring a minimum setback of 10 metres. The former Shell House, at No. 2-12 Carrington Street, an identified heritage item, has the potential to incorporate a modest vertical

\\Alpha\heritage\Projects\280121 City one\O - Design\O2 SITE ANALYSIS\1) Reports\HIS\101012 Concept Plan HIS revision.doc © HBO+EMTB 2005	Date: 12/10/10		C FINAL	Page 44
--	-------------------	--	------------	---------

extension in contemporary style which would complement the existing character of the building as seen from any elevated vantage points and would not be seen from ground level. The proposed addition is in fact one storey set within and away from the high parapets to Carrington Street and Margaret Street and would not be seen in the vistas from Wynyard Park, York Street and Margaret Street. The minimum 10m setback set in the Central Sydney Development Control Plan (DCP), 1996 is not necessary as the height and set back can be set below the sight lines determined from Wynyard Park, York Street and Carrington Street to the parapet lines.

The building envelope illustrated in the Concept Plan for this proposal illustrates a vertical extension over the roof area and behind the parapet of former Shell House at No. 2-12 Carrington Street which will not negatively impact on the assessed significance and streetscape quality.

Section 7 – City of Sydney Signage and Advertising Structures, Development Control Plan, 2005, identifies requirements for signs and advertising structures on heritage buildings. Potential signs and advertising for this development do not form part of this Concept Plan, which aims to establish building envelopes, boundaries and development in principle.

\\Alpha\heritage\Projects\280121 City one\O - Design\O2 SITE ANALYSIS\1) Reports\HIS\101012 Concept Plan HIS revision.doc © HBO+EMTB 2005	Date: 12/10/10		C FINAL	Page 45
--	-------------------	--	------------	---------

8.0 IMPACTS ARISING FROM ASSESSMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE.

8.1 IMPACTS ON HERITAGE ITEMS WITHIN THE SITE

8.1.1 THE FORMER SHELL HOUSE

The Conservation Management Plan for the former Shell House, 2-12 Carrington Street, has identified a number of constraints which have arisen from the assessment of significance. These items addresses; evolution of the building; design; structure; floor layout; potential uses - and identify a number of areas which will influence the proposed development.

The Concept Plan establishes the indicative building envelope. This envelope will add spaces both below and above the existing heritage item. The full nature of internal works has not been determined at this time except that it is proposed to retain the external envelope and clock tower.

With regard to the former Shell House, the Concept Plan building envelope, will only marginally impact on understanding the evolution of the building, its external form, original Commercial Palazzo fenestration, its original owner's historic importance and the building's contribution to the streetscape character defining the space around Wynyard Park.

The impact on the external form will be minimal, to the extent that a glazed wall may be perceived set back from the existing openings in the parapet of the former Shell House; the east elevation may be altered by additional openings at Wynyard Lane level and a new service core and, in some places, intake and exhaust louvres in lieu of windows. A structure for lift over runs, motor rooms and plant over the eastern service core would be set so far back on the building that it would not adversely affect views in sight lines over the Margaret Street and Carrington Street parapet copings. The vehicle ramp below to effect car park and service access will not cause any visual impact on the exterior.

The impact on the original Commercial Palazzo fenestration (if any) will be subject to the next application stage and should conform to the Conservation Management Plan. The more open spatial arrangements of the floors will be restored by returning the building to an office use. The retention of the heritage item, No. 2-12 Carrington Street and its incorporation into the overall development will be a positive feature allowing the presence of the building to be maintained, providing historic continuity and illustrating its importance to Sydney's Central Business District commercial building stock.

The internal structure and layout of the former Shell House will not be retained. Apart from the stairs there are no surviving internal details or finishes. These elements were completely stripped out in the conversion to a hotel, which also altered the spatial qualities the building presented as an office. The lifts, while in the original position, have been refitted. In terms of efficient office planning today, the existing lift core is in a very inconvenient location. The light well is an original feature reflecting Inter war period office design before the advent of air conditioning and fluorescent lighting. It is not proposed to retain the light well as this too would be prejudicial to the functionality of the accommodation provided by converting the building back to office space. Therefore there will be a loss of most of the internal structure and fabric of the former Shell House. These elements have been assessed as having generally low levels of significance, with the fire stairs, lift well walls and light well at a moderate level of significance. The loss of elements at these levels of significance is considered acceptable as it is necessary to ensure alteration to provide viable office accommodation supporting the retention of the highly significant Commercial Palazzo style exterior and clock tower and their important contribution to the streetscape.

The proposed building envelope for 2-12 Carrington Street will maintain the street wall containing the space around Wynyard Park, which will be a positive attribute to the proposal. However the overall

height of the envelope for the commercial tower will alter the existing spatial quality around the Park. Special care needs to be taken during the detailed design process to capitalise on the potential of the Concept Design to continue to produce a tower of elegant form as seen from Carrington Street, Wynyard Park, York Street and George Street in the modelling of the taller elements and the scale and proportion of their facades particularly to ensure the existing spatial qualities are not negatively impacted.

The impact on the significant external fabric of the existing heritage item, No. 2-12 Carrington Street, can not be fully assessed at this point. The next stage design must ensure the structural integrity of the significant envelope and clock tower of the item is maintained, in particular in dealing with the excavation below the existing basement. Otherwise, discussing the impact of the future work to the building's internal structure is beyond the scope of assessment of this Concept Plan proposal.

The Concept Plan provides for the former Shell House to operate as an office building, which will reinstate the original use. The proposed uses within the development will aid in activating Carrington Street and public activity within Wynyard Park - a positive outcome reinstating the importance of the Park as one of Sydney's public focal points.

8.1.2 WYNYARD PARK

The proposed altered railway entrance and sheltering structure will impact physically and visually on Wynyard Park. It should be recognised that this work is generally confined to the area of previous intervention into the landscape character of the park. However the degree of impact will depend on the treatment of the volume, in particular the transparency, height and form of the new structure sheltering an upgraded Station concourse. The existing structure in Wynyard Park used as an entrance for train commuters, due to its form and material, currently obstructs views and vistas through the park. The new structure indicated in the Concept Plan drawing can make a more positive contribution to the park by enhancing accessibility and hours of sunlight. To ensure the impact on the Park is minimised and positive and the amenity of the park is improved, there is considerable potential to introduce a new structure above Wynyard concourse that creates physical and visual links through a transparent volume.

On balance the concept must be considered to be positive in terms of impact, as it will substitute a much more open paved area and floating glazed canopy for the intrusive clutter of dome, vent stacks, descending stairs and walls that at present block vistas across the park.

8.2 IMPACTS ON HERITAGE ITEMS IN THE VICINITY

8.2.1 RAILWAY HOUSE

The concept plan proposes no works that would physically impact on Railway House. The visual impacts of the proposed new building between George Street and Carrington Street will be minimal due to the distance separation and partial screening effect of trees in Wynyard Park. The proposed new high rise building will have no greater or lesser impact than other high rise buildings that have been constructed in this locality.

The changes to the station entrance from Wynyard Park are considered to be an improvement in the setting of Railway House. The concept plan will remove the dome, stairs descending from the York Street footpath and other elements that create a cluttered urban space and will substitute a more clear, open space, which will allow better views from the park to appreciate the excellent architectural qualities of Railway House.

8.2.2 LISGAR HOUSE

There will be no physical impact on Lisgar House's facade, which is the significant portion of this building. The new building will abut Lisgar House on the northern side. The concept plan shows a

\\Alpha\heritage\Projects\280121 City one\O - Design\O2 SITE ANALYSIS\1) Reports\HIS\101012 Concept Plan HIS revision.doc © HBO+EMTB 2005	Date: 12/10/10		C FINAL	Page 47
--	-------------------	--	------------	---------

recessed articulated junction where the building adjoins. This design device is considered an improvement on the present situation, which is a much more abrupt juxtaposition of forms. There is already a disparity of scale in the relationship of the Menzies Hotel and Lisgar House. Although the proposed new high rise building will be taller than the Menzies Hotel, it is not considered that, as seen from the streets and the Park, this would read very differently to the present arrangement, except that it would be relieved considerably by the articulation at the junction of the new building and Lisgar House.

8.2.3 BENEFICIAL HOUSE

There will be no physical impact on Beneficial House. The new building will abut Beneficial House on the southern side. The concept plan shows a deeply recessed articulated junction where the building adjoins, which is considered an improvement on the present situation, which is a much more abrupt juxtaposition of forms. There is already a disparity of scale in the relationship of the Thakral Building and Beneficial House. Although the proposed new high rise building will be taller than the Thakral Building, it is not considered that, as seen from George and Hunter Streets, this would read very differently to the present arrangement, except that the visual relationship would be relieved considerably by the strong articulation of the new building form at the junction of the new building and Beneficial House.

8.2.4 SCOTS CHURCH AND ASSEMBLY HALL

The concept plan proposes no works that would physically impact on Scots Church and Assembly Hall. The visual impacts of the proposed new building between George Street and Carrington Street will be minimal due to the distance separation and the screening effect of trees in the northern portion of Wynyard Park. The proposed new high rise building will have no greater or lesser impact than other high rise buildings that have been constructed in this locality.

8.2.5 SKINNER'S FAMILY HOTEL (FORMER)

The concept plan proposes no works that would physically impact on Skinner's Family Hotel. The visual impacts of the proposed new building between George Street and Carrington will not be appreciably different than the effect of the existing Thakral Building.

8.2.6 WYNYARD STATION AND FORMER TRAM TUNNELS

No works are proposed that would physically or visually impact on the railway platforms or the former tram tunnels.

With regard to the less significant and much altered concourse areas the redevelopment process will largely retain the 1930s structural elements of steel beams and columns and floor levels in the areas under Carrington Street, Wynyard Park and York Street. The proposed changes to create better access, reactivate Wynyard Lane and create a more open well ventilated public concourse and retail facilities will occur where little or no 1930s fabric remains; eg the area between George Street and Carrington Street, where the Thakral Building and Menzies Hotel were constructed; and the area where, in 1995, access was created from Wynyard Park down to the concourse. The proposed more open access in this area will remove an accumulation of clutter comprising the glazed dome, the series of escalators and stairs and retail spaces, creating a greatly improved interface between the Wynyard Park and the station concourse areas.

9.0 MEASURES TAKEN TO MITIGATE IMPACT

This assessment does not find fault with the proposed building envelopes and uses provided that the detailed design resolution of the development, in the following stages, satisfies a number of parameters to address the heritage values of the site and the locality. The following comments therefore point to the next stage of the process by recommending measures that should be taken in the detailed planning and design.

9.1 FORMER SHELL HOUSE

- The roof top addition should be designed to be distinguished as an addition to assist in the interpretation and evolution of the building form and be set below sight lines generated from key vantage points in York Street and Margaret Street.
- The roof addition should appear as a light framed structure.
- Conservation of the glazed terra cotta facing material of the west, north and part east facades and the clock tower will require further technical research.
- Detailed solutions will be required to address deterioration of some internal structural elements of the Clock Tower: eg: spalling concrete.
- Undertake an archival record of the former Shell House in accordance with the guidelines published by the Heritage Branch of the NSW Department of Planning. The archival record should be carried out prior to commencement of internal demolition and construction, during the construction process and on completion.
- Incorporate into the new development, interpretation of the history of the site, including but not exclusively, the pre European history, history of the site from the arrival of the first fleet, the creation of the city circle railway, Shell House and the evolution of Wynyard Park. The interpretive venue should be in a prominent location, planned and designed by persons with expertise in heritage interpretation and executed to the highest standard of design commensurate with the quality of the design quality of the new development itself.
- Maintain the clear distinction between the new building form through articulation and lightness and transparency, where it adjoins the more solid masonry form of the former Shell House.

9.2 WYNYARD PARK

It is important that the intervention should not be seen to alienate the public domain but enhance it – people should still be able to walk north-south through the park at the west side and through.

- The height and form of the glazed canopy should not appear to obstruct the views along the park and it should be very transparent.
- Protect significant trees located to either side of proposed new open paved area, access to station and glazed canopy.
- The changed station entry should be limited to the existing paved and built zone with no reduction of grass or impact on tree root zones.

9.3 WYNYARD STATION

Attention should be given in the detailed design of the upgrade of the concourse and platforms to identify and retain for interpretive purposes elements of the 1932 structure, fabric and finishes that can be integrated into the overall design and to create opportunities to undertake restoration of deteriorated significant fabric and finishes and/or reconstruction of missing or damaged fabric and details where appropriate.

9.4 HERITAGE ITEMS IN THE VICINITY

\\Alpha\heritage\Projects\280121 City one\O - Design\O2 SITE ANALYSIS\1) Reports\HIS\101012 Concept Plan HIS revision.doc © HBO+EMTB 2005	Date: 12/10/10		C FINAL	Page 49
--	-------------------	--	------------	---------

There will be need to ensure that construction activities adjacent to Beneficial House and Lisgar House are carried out in such way that these buildings are not undermined or damaged in any other way. These issues are normally addressed by standard consent conditions, which will also require a conditions survey to be undertaken prior to commencement of the works. The concept plan has already given consideration to creation of articulated junctions where the new high rise building abuts these two buildings, which is an appropriate design solution. The degree to which this approach is successful will depend upon the detailed design, including the dimensions of the recessed junctions, the materials selected for the new construction in these locations and the treatment of the exposed return walls of Beneficial House and Lisgar House.

With regard to any visual impacts on Railway House, Scots Church and Assembly Hall and the former Skinner's Family Hotel there is no need to implement any mitigation measures.

10.0 CONCLUSION

The proposed Concept Plan for the "City One" project has the potential to positively reinforce the cultural significance of the heritage items identified within the proposal: the former Shell House (2-12 Carrington Street) and Wynyard Park and will not detrimentally visually or physically affect the assessed significance of the other heritage items in the vicinity.

The former Shell House has been assessed to have landmark qualities, as a consequence of its prominent corner location and relationship to Wynyard Park, reinforced through its unique architectural language. The former Shell House and Wynyard Park are also significant for their association with the historic and social context of this part of the city. The changes to be made by the proposed development will reinforce the streetscape presences of these two heritage items.

The development also aims to re-establish Wynyard Station as a principal transport hub, increasing the pedestrian activity with a link from George Street through to Wynyard Park. The opportunity created by of the City One development to remove intrusive elements form the centre of Wynyard Park will result in a more clean and open spatial quality, beneficial to the appreciation of the aesthetic values of the park and improving the setting for Railway House so that it will provide better views to its exceptional facade from within the park itself.

In conclusion the building envelope of the City One – Concept Plan can be supported on heritage grounds as it allows the cultural significance of the identified heritage items, former Shell House (2-12 Carrington Street) and Wynyard Park to be reinforced and will bring about a transformation of Wynyard Station worthy of its major role in the city's transport network with potential for opportunities to incorporate interpretive elements into a facility that meets the needs of the city into the 21st century