

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



| STATE AND LOCAL GOVERNMENT SUBMISSIONS |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|----------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Key Issues Raised                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         | Thakral Response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| Transport NSW                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|                                        | <p>Transport NSW made a comprehensive submission on a range of matters including issues to be addressed, suggested amendments to the Concept Plan, request for additional information and suggested conditions of consent. Overall, subject to the matters raised in their submission being addressed, Transport NSW generally supported the proposed Concept Plan.</p> <p>The key issues to be address are summarised below.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| 1                                      | <p>Consideration of Strategic benefit and public benefit</p> <p>The EAR either generally overstates the nature and extent of public benefits or does not provide sufficient evidence to demonstrate the nature and extent of public benefits.</p> <p>Transport NSW stated a monetary contribution towards public amenities and infrastructure improvements arising in connection with the development, including the Wynyard Station improvements, is considered to be appropriate.</p> <p>Transport NSW support a quantified contribution in the form of a Commercial Agreement and/or Voluntary Planning Agreement that is documented in advance of, or as part of a future Project Applications.</p> | <p>Additional information on the public benefits proposed as part of the City One Concept Plan is detailed at Section 2.1 of the PPR.</p> <p>The additional information identifies the physical works (in plan and written schedule) that are proposed to be undertaken by Thakral as a direct public benefit associated with the delivery of public domain and amenity improvements to the existing Wynyard Railway Station on land within the Concept Plan site area that is generally east of Carrington Street, and provides a cost estimate for these works. The cost estimate for the physical works proposed to be carried out by Thakral is \$20 million.</p> <p>In addition to the physical works proposed to be undertaken by Thakral on land generally east of Carrington Street, Thakral has proposed a contribution to Transport NSW in relation to future works on land generally west of Carrington Street.</p> <p>The PPR includes (refer to Appendix C) a formal offer by Thakral to enter into a Project Delivery Agreement (PDA) with Transport NSW for the delivery of the public benefits</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|---|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   |                                                                                                                                                            | <p>identified in the PPR.</p> <p>The PDA includes:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Conditions Precedent;</li> <li>▪ Process for future Project Applications;</li> <li>▪ Commercial Terms;</li> <li>▪ Process for Design;</li> <li>▪ Staging of Works;</li> <li>▪ Interface plans for controls and safety;</li> <li>▪ Commencement preconditions;</li> <li>▪ Construction requirements;</li> <li>▪ Existing tenancies;</li> <li>▪ Security and safety arrangements;</li> <li>▪ Re-subdivision and long term titles;</li> <li>▪ Insurance;</li> <li>▪ Certification;</li> <li>▪ Guarantees and unconditional undertakings;</li> <li>▪ RailCorp rights to “step in”.</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 2 | <p>Future Project Applications should clearly document any opportunities in regard to Carrington Street bus operations and bus users in the long term.</p> | <p>The existing Carrington Street bus operations are a matter beyond the scope of the Concept Plan Proposal – the Concept Plan does not propose any physical works to Carrington Street nor make any proposals with respect to the existing configuration or operation of bus services on Carrington Street or in the vicinity. The proposed new entry to Wynyard Station on Carrington Street will improve pedestrian connectivity between the Station and existing bus operations on Carrington Street, and assist in improving east west pedestrian flow between George Street, the existing bus services on Carrington Street, and the wider precinct beyond.</p> <p>The detailed design of any public domain works proposed to either Carrington Street, or to Wynyard Park, will be a relevant matter for assessment and determination as a part of future Project Application(s), and will be subject to further consultation with public transport authorities and City of Sydney Council. The revised Statement of Commitments (refer to</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|---|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          | <p>Commitment 4) reflect this requirement. Where relevant, future Project Application(s) will make proposals with respect to public domain improvements within the road reservation of Carrington Street, and will demonstrate appropriate pedestrian / bus user integration with the existing Carrington Street bus interchange. This requirement has also been included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Commitment 4).</p> <p>Future Project Application(s), where relevant, will also be required to demonstrate appropriate demolition and construction management methodology to ensure appropriate impacts on existing bus operations and pedestrian safety and amenity. Refer to revised Statement of Commitment 16.</p> <p>Refer also to Item 8 below.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
| 3 | <p><b>Concourse Design</b></p> <p>The Concept Design and construction staging presented in the EAR is not acceptable to Transport NSW. Thakral will need to enter into further detailed design discussions with Transport NSW and RailCorp to ensure that the CityOne development is fully integrated with future Wynyard Station concourse designs.</p> | <p>The EAR presents a concept design for the concourse east of Carrington Street. No concept design has been proposed for the concourse west of Carrington Street at this stage. The eastern concourse design is indicative only, and will be subject to detailed design resolution as part of the subsequent Project Application(s).</p> <p>Thakral will be contractually committed to further ongoing consultation with Transport NSW via the PDA in relation to resolution of the detailed design of the eastern concourse, and to ensuring that the eastern concourse design will allow for full and seamless integration with the future Wynyard Station concourse designs west of Carrington Street. The commitment towards consultation and agreement with Transport NSW in relation to the detailed design resolution of the eastern concourse is reflected in revised Statement of Commitment 2.</p> <p>The Concept Plan PPR presents a set of revised criteria to be applied in the detailed design of the eastern concourse. Refer to Appendix G of the PPR. The revised design criteria include specification of a minimum combined total width of pedestrian access between George Street and the concourse, and requirements with respect to both horizontal and vertical east west connectivity. The revised design criteria is reflected in revised</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Statements of Commitments 4.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|---|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 4 | <p>Performance Specifications</p> <p>Pedestrian modelling must be carried out to determine the necessary exit widths to 2060 and to test the performance of the proposed accessways and vertical transport (escalators, stairs, lifts etc). The provisional 20m eastern exit width requirement is inclusive of the Hunter Connection exit, which is approximately 4m in width at its narrowest point, meaning that a minimum of 16m of unimpeded exit width to George Street must be provided.</p> <p>The 20m exit width requirement must be via the most convenient route from the concourse to street level and must not be impeded by obstructions to pedestrian movement such as the pedestrian crossing of Wynyard Lane. This key design issue will need to be resolved to the satisfaction of Transport NSW as part of any Project Application.</p> | <p>The detailed design of the development east of Carrington Street is to provide a provisional minimum total combined pedestrian exit to the east via George Street and the Hunter Connection of 20 metres (including the 4 metre width of the Hunter Connection) and unimpeded flow to the street. The detailed design of the eastern exit will demonstrate that the unimpeded combined exit width to the east is via the most convenient route from the concourse to street level, and must not be impeded by obstructions to pedestrian movement.</p> <p>Thakral acknowledges and agrees with Transport NSW that the above provisional minimum unimpeded width of exit to George Street should be via the most convenient route from the concourse to street level, and must not be impeded by obstructions to pedestrian movement such as the pedestrian crossing of Wynyard Lane. Refer to discussion at Item 5 in relation to the revised proposal with respect to pedestrian movement within Wynyard Lane.</p> <p>Thakral also acknowledges and agrees with Transport NSW that the detailed design of the provisional 20 metres eastern exit width requirement should be subject to further detailed pedestrian modelling to confirm that this provisional requirement is the appropriate requirement to ensure the necessary exit widths to meet pedestrian demand to 2060, and to test the performance of proposed access ways and vertical transport (escalators, stairs, lifts etc) as part of the resolution of the detailed design of the eastern concourse. Accordingly, Thakral is committed to including pedestrian demand modelling and designing the eastern access way in accordance with Transport NSW functional specification requirements. These requirements are reflected in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Commitments 2).</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|---|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 5 | <p>Wynyard Lane</p> <p>The raising of Wynyard Lane and crossing points has impacts on pedestrian access and the resolution of this is not considered satisfactory. The current design does not satisfy Transport NSW's functional specifications for the eastern station access ways due to the obstruction of pedestrian flows by vehicles using Wynyard lane. This key design issue will need to be resolved to the satisfaction of transport NSW as part of any Project Application.</p> | <p>Thakral has amended the Concept Design for Wynyard Lane and the Preferred Project presents an alternative solution for Wynyard Lane that includes the closure of the lane at both the northern and southern ends of the development site. This will remove any obstruction to pedestrian flows from the eastern station access arising as a consequence of vehicles using Wynyard Lane and enable unimpeded pedestrian flow in an east west direction across Wynyard Lane. Refer to Section 2.3 of the PPR and to revised Statements of Commitments 4. It is noted that the Concept Plan does not propose any physical works to Wynyard Lane – all physical works will be subject to detailed design resolution as part of the subsequent detailed Project Application(s) following further consultation and agreement with City of Sydney Council and TNSW.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 6 | <p>Fire and Life Safety</p> <p>The Concept Plan should have considered the requirements of emergency egress/access within the wider Wynyard Station Precinct to effectively demonstrate a whole of precinct fire and life safety approach. Further analysis of fire and life safety issues prior to the finalisation of any future Project Applications is required to ensure an integrated fire and life safety system is implemented as part of the development.</p>                      | <p>Thakral agrees that appropriate resolution of existing and potential future fire and life safety issues at Wynyard Station as part of the detailed design phase of the project is highly important.</p> <p>The physical works proposed by Thakral east of Carrington Street will have an engineered fire solution and as recommended by Transport NSW, a comprehensive Fire and Life Safety report will need to be prepared and submitted with the future Project Application(s) for these works. The comprehensive Fire and Life Safety report will provide further analysis of fire and life safety issues, consider the relevant requirements of emergency egress / access within the wider Wynyard Station precinct, and address an integrated fire and life safety system as relevant. This requirement is reflected in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 19).</p> <p>It is noted that all specific requirements of emergency egress / access and the detailed design solutions in relation to any analysis of fire and life safety requirements within the western station concourse areas are a matter for determination by Transport NSW.</p> <p>An updated Fire and Life Safety Report is provided at Appendix J of the PPR. The updated</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|---|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 | Fire and Life Safety Report removes earlier references to indicative design outcomes west of Carrington Street, at the request of Transport NSW.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
| 7 | <p>Construction Staging</p> <p>The Concept Plan identifies an indicative schedule for the construction of the proposed commercial building and station concourse works. Further consideration of construction staging is essential to ensure that construction of the proposed commercial building does not affect the safe and effective operation of Wynyard Station. During construction, compliant access must be maintained between George Street and Wynyard Station.</p> | <p>Thakral agrees with Transport NSW that further consideration of construction staging will be essential to ensure that construction of the proposed commercial building does not affect the safe and effective operation of Wynyard Station. Thakral also agrees that during construction (and demolition) works, compliant access must be maintained between George Street and Wynyard Station. Determination of the full demolition and construction methodology and management requirements will need to occur in consultation with Transport NSW, City of Sydney Council and other relevant parties.</p> <p>The revised Statements of Commitment include a requirement that the future Project Application(s) for the construction of works east of Carrington Street include a detailed Construction Management Plan prepared in consultation with Transport NSW and City of Sydney Council that includes details in relation to scheduling and staging of demolition and construction works, and how compliant access between George Street and Wynyard Station will be maintained.</p> <p>An amended construction methodology has been prepared by Robert Bird Group and is submitted with the PPR. The amended construction methodology is not intended to provide further detail with respect to the matters raised by Transport NSW. It has been updated to remove certain assumptions that were previously made in relation to staging and methodology for works west of Carrington Street.</p> |
| 8 | <p>Operational Integrity</p> <p>During any development of the Wynyard Precinct, critical infrastructure requirements would need to be considered, including station operability and management of critical infrastructure and systems. This will require detailed analysis and consultation with Transport NSW, RailCorp</p>                                                                                                                                                    | <p>Thakral agrees with Transport NSW that critical infrastructure requirements, including station operability and management of critical infrastructure and systems will require detailed analysis as part of the detailed design stage of the project, and that ensuring critical infrastructure needs are met is a fundamental matter for resolution as part of the next stages of the development. As recommended by Transport NSW, Thakral is committed to</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |

## MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

### RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|  |                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|--|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | <p>and State Transit Authority before the finalisation of any future CityOne Project Applications.</p> | <p>ongoing consultation with RailCorp and Transport NSW as part of the detailed design stage to ensure the operational requirements of RailCorp and Transport NSW are met during and post construction. The requirement for ongoing consultation in relation to this matter is included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 8).</p> <p>Future Project Application(s) will be accompanied by the following relevant studies:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"><li>▪ Construction Management Plan;</li><li>▪ Acoustic Assessment;</li><li>▪ Electrolysis Impact Assessment;</li><li>▪ Dilapidation Survey;</li><li>▪ Geotechnical Assessment; and</li><li>▪ Structural Engineering Assessment.</li></ul> <p>These requirements are included in the revised Statement of Commitments.</p> |
|--|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 9  | <p><b>Bus Services and Infrastructure</b></p> <p>A future Project Application must address the impacts on the operation of buses along George Street and in particular Carrington Street. The proposed raised pedestrian crossing on Carrington Street is not supported.</p> | <p>A Traffic and Parking Report will be submitted with any future Project Application(s). The report will include a detailed assessment of bus operations in the Wynyard Park precinct, including along George Street and Carrington Street. This requirement is included in the revised Statements of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 12).</p> <p>The amended Concept Plan proposal presented in the PPR does not include the raised pedestrian crossing on Carrington Street. Future public domain improvements west of Carrington Street are a matter for determination by Transport NSW and City of Sydney Council as part of the next stages of the project.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 10 | <p><b>Car Parking</b></p> <p>Transport NSW recommends that the maximum amount of tenant parking be reduced from the 177 spaces to 81 spaces. In the longer term Transport NSW does not support the use of the former tram tunnels for public car parking.</p>                | <p>The amended Concept Plan proposal presented in the PPR proposes no net increase in existing on site parking. Thakral does not propose to reduce the 177 car parking spaces sought for use by the tenants of the commercial tower to 81 spaces as recommended by Transport NSW. However, Thakral proposes to reallocate 177 of the existing public car parking spaces provided in the on site public car park (which is currently managed by Thakral) to commercial tenant parking for the CityOne development. This will ensure that there is no net increase in parking on the site / in the precinct. Refer to Section 2.6 of the PPR, and to the updated Traffic and Parking Report included at Appendix D.</p> <p>Thakral also acknowledges that RailCorp may in the longer term use the former tram tunnels for rail infrastructure purposes and that if RailCorp were to terminate Thakral's existing lease over the former tram tunnels, there would therefore be a further reduction in car parking spaces in the precinct arising as a consequence of the removal of existing public parking within these tunnels.</p> <p>It is noted that the amended Concept Plan proposal presented in the PPR proposes that all vehicles exit the car park via the existing tram tunnels to Cumberland Street. As identified</p> |



# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|----|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | at Section 2.3 of the PPR, this arrangement is proposed until such time as RailCorp terminates Thakral's existing lease over the former tram tunnels. At this time, vehicles will be able to exit the development onto Margaret Street.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 11 | <p><b>Pedestrian Flows</b></p> <p>Further pedestrian modelling is required based on updated station designs and demand forecasts to validate station exit width requirements and accessway designs to 2060.</p> <p>Transport NSW does not support a raised priority pedestrian crossing on Carrington Street, nor at grade pedestrian crossing as it would hinder bus services.</p> <p>Materials, surfaces, light etc used in public station accessways must be coordinated with Transport NSW (and City of Sydney Council) to ensure that the Wynyard Precinct reads as a totality.</p> <p>A signage strategy should be prepared as part of any Project Application, to the satisfaction of Transport NSW and consistent with Transport NSW's Interchange Guidelines.</p> | <p>This matter is addressed at Item 3 above. The future relevant Project Application will include pedestrian demand modelling and the eastern access ways will be designed in accordance with Transport NSW functional specification requirements.</p> <p>This matter is addressed at Item 8 above. A future Project Application for the eastern access ways will be limited to the area between the east of Carrington Street and George Street. However the detailed design of this area will be done in consultation with RailCorp and Transport NSW to ensure the development is well integrated with the Wynyard Station areas underneath and west of Carrington Street. .</p> <p>The future Project Application for the design and construction of the eastern access ways will include detailed information on materials, fixtures and finishes. This requirement is included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 2).</p> <p>A signage strategy will be included in the relevant Project Application(s). This requirement is included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 2).</p> |
| 12 | <p><b>Traffic network</b></p> <p>A future Project Application must address impacts on traffic flows, road closures, provision of taxi ranks, bicycle parking travel demand management, CBD Light rail extension and</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | <p>A detailed Traffic and Transport Report will be submitted with a future Project Application addressing these matters. This requirement is included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 12).</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    | impacts on proposed metro corridor.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 13 | <p>Environmental matters</p> <p>Additional information and assessment of heritage and wind impacts is required. Further information on overshadowing of Wynyard Park is required.</p>                                                                                                | <p>A detailed overshadowing analysis of Wynyard Park has been prepared and submitted with the PPR. The shadowing impacts to Wynyard Park are further described in Section 2.4 of the PPR. As demonstrated, the additional overshadowing impacts to Wynyard Park comply with existing planning controls and are satisfactory in relation to amenity impacts. Future Project Application(s) will be required to verify the overshadowing impacts of the detailed design of the future building are within the shadow impacts assessed as part of the Concept Plan. This requirement is included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 24).</p> <p>The Concept Plan proposal is accompanied by a preliminary wind assessment that identifies the likely wind impacts associated with the development of the tower. The initial advice is that due to the sheltered location of the site there are minimal issues expected. A detailed wind tunnel model will be included with a future Project Application once the future design of the tower form within the proposed building envelope is resolved this will need to include the railway hall given its large open volume. This requirement is included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 18).</p> <p>Additional advice from the project heritage consultant has been provided and is included with the PPR (Appendix F). A detailed heritage report will also be required to accompany any future Project Application(s). This requirement is included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 26).</p> |
| 14 | <p>RailCorp Infrastructure and Services</p> <p>A future Project Application must also detail RailCorp services and infrastructure within the precinct. Any relocation or protection of RailCorp infrastructure and services will be at the proponent's cost and subject to prior</p> | <p>Thakral commit to ongoing consultation with RailCorp in relation to the protection of RailCorp infrastructure and services. As recommended by Transport NSW, the future Project Application(s) will include a detailed assessment of any potential impacts to RailCorp infrastructure and mitigation and management measures, including relocation of infrastructure and services (if required). This requirement is included in the revised</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|---------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                     | agreement with RailCorp.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 8).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 15                  | <p>Conditions of Consent</p> <p>Transport NSW submission included 27 conditions of consent be included in any future project approval.</p>                                                                                                                                     | <p>Noted. The recommended conditions are a matter for consideration at the time of any future project application, and it is not proposed to incorporate them into the Statement of Commitments at this time.</p> <p>A number of the operation al integrity conditions are addressed in the Statement of Commitments. Further it is anticipated that the proposed operational integrity conditions will be also addressed in the proposed PDA.</p> <p>The suggested conditions in relation to construction traffic management can be addressed in Construction Traffic Management Plan. A comprehensive Construction Traffic Management Plan will be prepared a submitted with the Project Application – refer to Statement of Commitment 12</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| <b>Heritage NSW</b> |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
| 1                   | <p>The following issues were raised by Heritage NSW:</p> <p>The proposed form of the tower development is inconsistent with the predominant height and character of buildings to the east of Wynyard Park and will therefore impact on the surrounding heritage buildings.</p> | <p>There is no predominant height of buildings on the eastern side of Carrington Street. Refer to elevation included at Figure 7 (Section 2.5 of the PPR). Notwithstanding, additional urban design analysis has been undertaken by Hassell and further advice sought from the heritage consultant in relation to the presentation of the tower form to Carrington Street. In response to the heritage advice, the PPR presents a revised tower envelope that is set back by 6m from the southern end of Shell House. Furthermore, to respond to concerns raised in relation to the proposed street wall and building setback on Carrington Street, the PPR presents a revised tower envelope that incorporates an upper level setback of 3.5 metres between RL 56 (37m) and RL 63.6(45m) on Carrington Street. The 7.6 metre high setback zone has been positioned to respond to the key existing elements in the Carrington Streetscape, including particularly the fenestration on the facade of Shell House.</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|---|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   |                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 2 | The Heritage Impact Statement does not provide sufficient detail on the internal elements of Shell House and therefore if they should be retained or demolished. | The heritage significance of Shell House is its historical land use as the Head Office of the Shell Oil Company, who commissioned the design of the building. The exterior facade is also of significance as an example of Interwar Commercial Palazzo style architecture. The Heritage Impact Statement submitted with the Concept Plan provides an assessment of the significance of Shell House, and identifies those elements of the building that are considered to be of heritage significance. The assessment notes that there have been extensive modifications to the internal areas of the building and that apart from the internal stairs there are no surviving internal finishes or details. It also assesses the impact of the proposed building envelope on Shell House. Further heritage assessment will be required to support the detailed design of the future built form, including materials and finishes and facade design. This requirement is included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 26). |
| 3 | There is no detailed discussion of the archaeology of the site and potential impacts of the proposed works.                                                      | <p>The Concept Plan does not propose any physical excavation or other subsurface disturbance works. The site is highly disturbed due to the existence of Wynyard Railway Station which is predominantly below ground, and its associated network of tunnels.</p> <p>The Sydney LEP 2005 heritage map of underground archaeological items does not identify any items under the site or in the vicinity of the site.</p> <p>Further detail with respect to the potential archaeological impacts of the proposed works and identification of any recommended mitigation measures will be included in the future Project Application(s) that will identify the extent of excavation / subsurface works. This requirement is included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 26).</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 4 | The HIA does not discuss the archaeological potential of Wynyard Park                                                                                            | No physical works to Wynyard Park are proposed as part of the Concept Plan. At the time of any relevant application relating to subsurface works within Wynyard Park, as above further detail will be provided with respect to the potential for archaeological impacts and recommended mitigation measures. This requirement is included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 26)                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 5 | Further studies must be undertaken to identify and detail heritage items and fabric and assess potential impacts.                                                | The proposed development will include significant redevelopment of the eastern concourse of Wynyard Railway Station. Further detailed studies on heritage items within Wynyard Station will be undertaken and included with the relevant Project Application. This requirement is included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment x).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



| Sydney Water   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|----------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 1              | The drinking water mains available for connection are either the west side of George Street or east side of York Street. If the York Street main is connected to, a number of conditions may be imposed regarding building over a Sydney Water easement.                                                            | Noted. Future connections to Sydney Water mains will be determined at the detailed Project Application stage.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 2              | The current wastewater system has sufficient capacity to service the proposed development                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Noted.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 3              | In the event trade waste is generated, an application for permission to discharge trade wastewater to the sewerage system is required to be lodged with Sydney Water.                                                                                                                                               | Noted. Waste water discharge is a matter to be determined at the detailed Project Application stage.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| City of Sydney |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                     |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|                | <p>The City of Sydney Council submission has raised a number of issues regarding the proposed project and has made 13 specific recommendations in relation to these issues.</p> <p>In addition to the 13 recommendations the City of Sydney disagree with the site area calculation detailed in the EAR report.</p> | <p>Thakral's detailed response to the 13 recommendations made by the Council is provided below.</p> <p>The site area identified in the EAR has been calculated in accordance with the definition of site area contained within Central Sydney LEP 2005. The relevant definition of site area allows for the inclusion of stratum beneath areas of public domain.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 1              | <p>The City of Sydney Council thirteen recommendations are:</p> <p>That a quantified and documented 'contribution' of public benefit offer be submitted for public exhibition and consideration by the City of Sydney prior to determination of the Concept Plan.</p>                                               | <p>Additional information on the public benefits of the proposal is included at Section 2.1 of the PPR. As identified in the PPR The additional information identifies the physical works (in plan and written schedule) that are proposed to be undertaken by Thakral as a direct public benefit associated with the delivery of public domain and amenity improvements to the existing Wynyard Railway Station on land within the Concept Plan site area that is generally east of Carrington Street, and provides a cost estimate for these public infrastructure works. The cost estimate for the public infrastructure works proposed to be carried out during the redevelopment is \$20 million.</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|---|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        | <p>In addition to the physical works proposed to be undertaken by Thakral on land generally east of Carrington Street, Thakral has proposed a contribution to Transport NSW in relation to future works on land generally west of Carrington Street.</p> <p>The works and contributions to be provided to TNSW will be contained in a Project Delivery Agreement with RailCorp (refer to Appendix C). The PDA will contain the following items:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Economic benefits in relation to the new through site link and associated works (value \$60m);</li> <li>▪ Public Infrastructure works to be provided during the redevelopment (value \$20m);</li> <li>▪ Further contractual and commercial considerations including additional monetary contributions to be finalised with TNSW.</li> </ul>                                                                             |
| 2 | If deemed appropriate for approval (following Recommendation 1), that any public benefit offer is legally binding prior to determination of the Concept Plan (or predicate activation, any scale of, of the Concept Plan to finalisation of the public benefit offer). | As stated above, Thakral will enter into a Project Delivery Agreement with Transport NSW/RailCorp. The PDA will be a legally binding document that will contain numerous conditions precedent to be met prior to RailCorp providing any future land owners consent for a detailed Project Application.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 3 | If the transit hall between George Street and Carrington Street is part of any Public Benefit schedule of works, the upper commercial foyer should be removed to ensure that the space lives up to the promise of a world class unobstructed transit volume.           | <p>The Concept Design has entry heights for the Transit Hall of 13 metres (3 - 4 storeys) at the George Street frontage and 8 metres (2 – 3 storeys) at the Carrington Street frontage. The 8m high Carrington entry defines the limit of the view corridor.</p> <p>Irrespective of the proposed commercial foyer space, the volume of the proposed transit hall space, and its configuration does provide a significant public benefit and represents a significant amenity improvement for Wynyard Station. An alternative scheme that did not propose a public benefit component would comprise a simple 20 metre wide and no more than 5 meter high ground level entry to the Station from George Street. Under such an alternative 'no public benefit scheme' access to the commercial lobby and foyer would be provided at ground level. The suggestion that there is no public benefit at all that can be</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
|---|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   |                                                                                                                                                                              | <p>associated with the provision of the transit hall due to the existence of the proposed foyer space is not agreed with.</p> <p>Furthermore, at present there is no site link with Carrington Street from George Street, the proposed entry from Carrington Street is 8 meters high and is considered generous. In addition, the commercial foyer proposed does not occupy the entire “plan” area as it is cut out to provide further daylight access and greater connectivity with the rail hall below. Removing this element altogether risks having a large empty space that will be out of proportion.</p> <p>Section 2.5 of the PPR provides further justification with respect to the transit hall space, in relation to both the volume of the space and the spatial experience as a pedestrian moves through the space between George and Carrington Street.</p> <p>Deletion of the commercial foyer space is not proposed. This space is required to provide connectivity to the commercial core. Furthermore, this space is desirable from a visual interest and activation design point of view. Further detail on these matters is provided at Section 2.5 of the PPR.</p> <p>Notwithstanding, as part of the PPR response, Hassell has reviewed and considered three potential options for reducing and reconfiguring the foyer space to further increase the void space within the transit hall and to further open pedestrian view corridors through the site. The three options involve shortening the foyer space at both its eastern and western ends, shifting the space to the north or shifting the space to the south, all potential options to further increase the expanse of unimpeded void space to the concourse. Give that the detailed design of the commercial foyer space needs to be resolved at the same time as the detailed design of the remainder of the tower layout, including, particularly, the core, it is proposed that the detailed design and final configuration of the space be resolved at the Project Application stage.</p> |
| 4 | The Department of Planning convene a Working Party with the specific, objective of addressing the issues associated with Wynyard Lane and its integration into the ‘CityOne’ | The PPR presents a revised concept proposal in relation to Wynyard Lane. As detailed at Section 2.3 of the PPR a number of options have been examined in relation to the integration of Wynyard Lane into the CityOne Concept Plan, and the amended Concept Plan                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|---|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   | <p>Concept Plan. The Working Party should consist of members from the following groups:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ The Department of Planning;</li> <li>▪ The Proponent – both from a commercial and architectural perspective;</li> <li>▪ Transport NSW (RailCorp); and</li> <li>▪ The City of Sydney</li> </ul> <p>Options developed by the Working Party must then be placed on public exhibition for public comment.</p>                            | <p>includes a concept proposal for the closure of Wynyard Lane at both the northern and southern ends of the development to remove any potential conflict between pedestrians and vehicles within the development site. The proposal to close Wynyard Lane is incorporated in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 7).</p> <p>The options examined for Wynyard Lane were canvassed at an informal working group meeting between the Department of Planning, Thakral, Transport NSW and the Council held on 10<sup>th</sup> February 2011, and subsequently formally provided to the Council prior to submission of the PPR.</p> <p>Thakral acknowledges and agrees with Council that the resolution of the details relating to the closure of Wynyard Lane, should this concept proposal be approved as part of the Concept Plan, and the detailed design of any public domain works within the laneway relating to its closure and to improvements to the existing pedestrian environment is a matter that will require both consultation with and agreement with the Council.</p> <p>Thakral is also committed to ongoing further consultation with all relevant parties as part of this process, including Transport NSW. This commitment is incorporated in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 7).</p> <p>Thakral also acknowledges that the process to seek approval to close Wynyard Lane will need to occur concurrently with the detailed design phase of the development, to ensure that the laneway closure and associated public domain works are delivered prior to completion of the CityOne development.</p> |
| 5 | <p>That the Concept Plan includes clear principles for the proposed design of Wynyard Park and Wynyard Station entrances in consultation with the City and Transport NSW (provided there is no detrimental effect on the park). The concepts should include a sketch design and could include written objectives for the items, as well as a statement regarding the future flexibility of the design given the timing, monetary and methodology constraints of these</p> | <p>The Concept Plan identifies a zone within which public domain improvements may be proposed within Wynyard Park. This zone includes the existing station entrances and station dome area.</p> <p>The future design of any public domain improvements or Station entrances within Wynyard Park will be the subject of future approvals sought as relevant by Transport NSW, and is a matter for determination and proposal by Transport NSW in consultation with the Council.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |



# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
|---|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   | <p>infrastructure projects. The following items should form principles for the future design of the station and park west of Carrington Street:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Relocation of station entry points to the north and south off site extremities at Margaret Street &amp; Wynyard Street (as shown in Figure 7);</li> <li>▪ Increase in soft landscape area and protection of trees;</li> <li>▪ Exceptional permeability and legibility focusing on commuter and user projection figures into the future;</li> <li>▪ Design full integration with public assets; and</li> <li>▪ As an alternative to location off park extremities, a new entry canopy of exceptional beauty with daylight in the current location.</li> </ul> | <p>In response to the issues raised by the Council, the PPR includes a set of written design principles to be applied in the future design of the station and its interface with Wynyard Park. The written design principles include the substance of all of the principles as recommended by the Council in its submission. Refer to Section 2.4 of the PPR.</p> <p>The requirement to respond to the specified design principles as part of the detailed design of the Wynyard Park public domain have also been incorporated into the Statement of Commitments (refer to Statements of Commitment 4).</p>                     |
| 6 | <p>That a street frontage height to approx. RL62 (to match Shell House be required for the new tower for Carrington Street.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | <p>Additional urban design analysis has been undertaken by Hassell and is detailed at Section 2.5 of the PPR. The options of providing a full tower setback at RL 62 as recommended by the Council, and of providing a partial setback zone between RL62 and RL 72 has been examined as part of this analysis.</p> <p>As described at Section 2.5, based on the additional urban design analysis undertaken by Hassell, the PPR presents a revised tower building envelope that incorporates a 6m setback from the southern boundary of Shell House and a 3.5m setback zone on Carrington Street between RL56m and RL 63.6m.</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|---|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       | <p>The positioning of the 3.5 metre street frontage setback on Carrington Street is proposed to match the fenestration of Shell House. It is considered that positioning the setback at RL56 provides a better urban design response to the existing Carrington Street street wall instead of RL 62 as has been recommended by the Council (refer to discussion and further justification at Section 2.5 of the PPR).</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 7 | <p>The street frontage should be differentiated from the treatment of the tower facades above, preferably with highly detailed masonry elements, indicative aspects of the proposed design suggested in the concept plan submission with a masonry inclusion should be developed.</p> | <p>Thakral acknowledges and agrees with the Council that the design solution for the street frontage element of the project should be required to differentiate the facade treatment from the tower elements. It is noted that whilst masonry elements can be accommodated, there is a need to ensure an appropriate design outcome is achieved with regard to the significance of the Shell House facade. A degree of transparency to the transit hall on both George and Carrington Streets to provide for light and visual permeability to the Station will also be required.</p> <p>The PPR includes design requirements for the future building(refer to Appendix G).</p> <p>A range of architectural treatments to the facade will be developed for a Design Panel to test. The facade treatments and materials will be detailed in the future Project Application for the building.</p>                                                       |
| 8 | <p>The relationship with adjoining heritage-listed items must be an important consideration of any future project application. The connection with Shell House should be articulated and consider the fenestration, datum and cornice lines in developing the facade solution.</p>    | <p>Additional urban design analysis and consideration of the relationship of the proposed building envelope with adjoining buildings, including heritage listed items, has been undertaken by Hassell as identified above and is detailed at Section 2.5 of the PPR. The additional urban design analysis has occurred with the specific input of the project team heritage consultant HBO + EMTB, particularly in relation to the relationship of the building envelope to Shell House.</p> <p>The heritage significance of Shell House and its influence on the visual character of the street has been a key element in determining the proposed street wall definition and upper level tower setback on Carrington Street that is proposed in the amended Concept Plan proposal. The amended building envelope proposes a 6 metre tower setback from the southern boundary of Shell House and a 10 metre high, 3.5 metre deep setback on the</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |
|----|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                             | <p>Carrington Street elevation to match the facade of Shell House.</p> <p>A range of architectural treatments to the Carrington Street facade, in particular the design of the street fenestration between 35m and 45m will be developed for a Design Panel to test. The facade treatments and materials will be detailed in the future Project Application for the building. This requirement is included in the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 3).</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 9  | That the proposal be required to maintain a setback to Carrington Street above RL 62 for a weighted average of 8 metres (with an absolute minimum of 6 metres).                                             | <p>Additional urban design analysis has been undertaken and is detailed at Section 2.5 of the PPR. The building envelope has been amended to incorporate a 6m setback from the southern boundary of Shell House. In addition there will be 3.5m setback on Carrington Street between RL56m and RL63.6m. It is considered that the proposed amended Concept Plan envelope demonstrates an appropriate response to underlying objectives of Council's street wall height and tower setback controls, notwithstanding that it continues to depart from the provisions that require a weighted average setback of 8 metres with a minimum of 6 metres. Further discussion and justification is provided at Section 3 of the PPR.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
| 10 | Prior to the approval of the Concept Plan, detailed wind tunnel testing should be carried out to demonstrate that wind conditions in the public domain (including Wynyard park) will satisfy DCP standards. | <p>The wind report submitted with the EAR address the potential impacts of a flat building face on Carrington Street and noted that due to the topography and presence of existing buildings to the west, the City One building will be relatively well shielded. It is considered that detailed wind tunnel testing of the Concept Plan envelope is not required in order to reasonably determine the likely wind impacts associated with the proposal, and that the recommendations contained within the preliminary wind report to be adopted at the time of detailed design of the proposed development are satisfactory with respect to demonstrating that wind impacts are a constraint that can readily be addressed as part of the detailed architectural design resolution.</p> <p>In addition, the inclusion of a 3.5m setback for the proposed envelope will further reduce the already minimal amount of wind flow induced down a windward face. In this case the west face is relatively well shielded and the amount of wind flow being induced to ground level would be small as confirmed by the wind consultant.</p> <p>Thakral acknowledges and agrees with the Council that detailed wind tunnel testing is</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
|----|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                    | <p>required, however it is considered appropriate that this detailed wind tunnel testing be undertaken in relation to the final detailed design of the proposed building. To ensure that the future detailed design of the tower will be satisfactory with respect to Council's DCP standards, the revised Statement of Commitment includes a requirement for verification of the preliminary wind assessment to be undertaken at the detailed design stage via wind tunnel testing, and for a Wind Impact Statement to be submitted with the detailed Project Application demonstrating that Council's DCP standards relating to wind will be met. Refer to Statement of Commitment 18.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 11 | <p>That the proponent be required to provide more detailed sun shadow model of affected buildings in Martin Place in elevation with any Major project application to ensure that there is absolutely no overshadowing of the heritage listed GPO faced or steps in Martin Place, and that the proponent be requested to model the concept plan envelope to minimise the additional overshadowing of the western end of Martin Place paving to less than that proposed in the current concept plan application.</p> | <p>Further shadow analysis of Martin Place has been prepared by Whelans Insites and is included at Appendix E of the PPR. The height of the proposed building was calculated using the sun access plane intersection with the base of the steps at the GPO Sydney and results tabulated (see additional Whelans report 15/03/2011). This calculation confirms that there is no additional overshadowing of the GPO steps or sandstone façade as a result of the proposed development based on the building envelopes proposed.</p> <p>The amended building envelope presented in the PPR remains unchanged with respect to the sun access plane and therefore will continue to cast a minor additional shadow on the George Street footpath at Martin Place as presented in the original EAR. The proposed Concept Plan building envelope is already 98 metres below the maximum height permitted on the site, and fully complies with the Martin Place Sun Access Plane. Further reduction in the height or configuration of the tower form to further minimise overshadowing of the Martin Place footpath is not able to be accommodated without rendering the project commercially unviable. As demonstrated in the original EAR, the loss of sunlight access to the Martin Place footpath is not considered to generate any significant corresponding loss in public amenity.</p> <p>Thakral acknowledges and agrees with the Council that once the detailed design of the tower form is resolved as part of the detailed Project Application proposal, confirmation will need to be provided from a registered surveyor to confirm that the building is contained within the proposed envelope and that there is absolutely no overshadowing of the heritage listed GPO facade or steps in Martin Place. This requirement is included in the revised</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|----|------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 3).                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                          |
| 12 | In accordance with SLEP 2005, the applicant should be required to undertake a design completion, in accordance with the provisions of LEP 1996 and Part 12 of the DCP.                                                                                           | <p>Thakral proposes a Design Review Panel be established, rather than a Design Competition.</p> <p>An independent Design Review Panel would provide advice on the design excellence of the building. It is suggested that a Design Review Panel could include up to three members appointed by the Director General, with at least one member of the Review Panel being an officer of the Department of Planning.</p> <p>The Design Review Panel could have regard to, but not limited to, the following matters:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>whether a high standard of architectural design, materials and detailing appropriate to the building type and location will be achieved.</li> <li>whether the form and external appearance of the building responds to adjoining heritage items and will improve the quality and amenity of the public domain.</li> <li>whether the building will meet sustainable design principles in terms of sunlight, natural ventilation, wind, reflective, visual and acoustic privacy, safety and security, and energy and water efficiency.</li> </ul> <p>It is recommended that the advice of the Design Review Panel is to be taken into consideration by the consent authority in the assessment of the future Project Application(s). These requirements are incorporated into the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 3).</p> |
| 13 | It is recommended that there is no net increase in the number of parking spaces provided on the site for either the commercial car-park or the tenant parking, over the existing supply. Parking should not be provided for the retail portion of this building. | The amended Concept Plan proposal presented in the PPR proposes no net increase in existing on site parking as recommended by the Council. Thakral proposals to reallocate 177 of the existing public car parking spaces provided in the on site public car park (which is currently managed by Thakral) to commercial tenant parking for the CityOne development. This will ensure that there is no net increase in parking on the site / in the precinct. Refer to Section 2.6 of the PPR, and to the updated Traffic and Parking Report                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|  |  |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |
|--|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  |  | <p>included at Appendix D.</p> <p>Thakral also acknowledges that RailCorp may in the longer term use the former tram tunnels for rail infrastructure purposes and that if RailCorp were to terminate Thakral's existing lease over the former tram tunnels, there would therefore be a further reduction in car parking spaces in the precinct arising as a consequence of the removal of existing public parking within these tunnels.</p> <p>It is noted that the amended Concept Plan proposal presented in the PPR proposes that all vehicles exit the car park via the existing tram tunnels to Cumberland Street. As identified at Section 2.6 of the PPR, this arrangement is proposed until such time as RailCorp terminates Thakral's existing lease over the former tram tunnels. At this time, vehicles will be able to exit the development onto Margaret Street.</p> |
|--|--|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



| INDUSTRY GROUP SUBMISSIONS |                                                 |                  |
|----------------------------|-------------------------------------------------|------------------|
|                            | Key Issues Raised                               | Thakral Response |
|                            | <b>Property Council of Australia</b>            |                  |
| 1                          | Letter of support for the proposed Concept Plan | Noted.           |
|                            | <b>Sydney Business Chamber</b>                  |                  |
| 2                          | Letter of support for the proposed Concept Plan | Noted.           |
|                            | <b>Infrastructure Partnerships Australia</b>    |                  |
| 3                          | Letter of support for the proposed Concept Plan | Noted.           |
|                            | <b>Committee for Sydney</b>                     |                  |
| 4                          | Letter of support for the proposed Concept Plan | Noted.           |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



| LANDOWNER SUBMISSIONS |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
|-----------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|                       | Key Issues Raised                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Thakral Response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|                       | Wynyard Shop Owners                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 1                     | <p>Two submissions have been made objecting to the proposed development on the grounds that the respective tenants had recently entered into new leases with RailCorp for shops located underneath Wynyard Park and that the tenants object to the proposed development if it results in closure of business or adversely affects the business.</p> <p>The submissions:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>Request clarification as to whether tenancies will be directly affected;</li> <li>Seek new or replacement retail spaces to be provided in the same location;</li> <li>Seek first right of refusal on occupying/leasing any new retail spaces.</li> </ul> | <p>The CityOne development proposed by Thakral will result in the redevelopment of the existing retail space between George Street and the eastern side of Carrington Street. Detailed designs for the Station east of Carrington Street will be undertaken by TransportNSW and documented in a future application.</p> <p>No physical works are however proposed as part of the Concept Plan, and approval of the Concept Plan will not allow for any works to commence. Accordingly, no existing tenants will be affected by approval of the Concept Plan.</p> <p>The timing and staging of works that may affect existing retail tenancies is a matter to be determined as part of the detailed Project Application stage.</p> <p>It is noted that the leasing terms and contractual arrangements between RailCorp and individual shop leaseholders outside of the area of land managed by Thakral is not a matter to which Thakral can respond.</p> |
| 2                     | <p>A submission from the owner of hotSKIES retail outlet objected to the proposed Concept Plan on the following grounds:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>the proposal will not alleviate the peak hour congestion associated with the ticketing area/gates</li> </ul>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            | <p>Thakral has prepared an indicative plan for the reconfiguration of the accessways from George Street and Carrington Street to Wynyard Station. The reconfigured access ways will provide new and expanded pedestrian travel paths which will improve travel times and relieve pedestrian congestion in station precinct. The pedestrian capacity of the station cannot be improved overall with improving the connections to Carrington Street and George</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |



# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS

|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|---|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   | <p>and capacity of platforms 3 and 4;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>the proposal to construct a Wynyard Station entrance on the east side of Carrington Street will create increased pedestrian movement crossing Carrington Street, presenting an increased pedestrian hazard;</li> <li>the height of the proposed tower will have negative overshadowing impact on Wynyard Park;</li> <li>the proposed additional parking is to great and will further impact on an already congested area;</li> <li>the proposal will not reduced pedestrian travel times and adds little to the functionality of the precinct</li> </ul> <p>The submission recommends that the Wynyard Lane Car Park be closed and platforms 1 and 2 be reinstated as operational platforms.</p> | <p>Street.</p> <p>Thakral acknowledges that AM peak hour congestion at Wynyard Station is a result of capacity of the ticketing gates and platforms and is proposing to provide a monetary contribution to the State Government towards the upgrade of the ticketing and platform areas.</p> <p>Further analysis of the overshadowing impacts has been undertaken by Whelan Insites and confirms that proposed building envelope does not result in any additional overshadowing during the key midday-2pm period during winter. Minor additional overshadowing of the Park and Railway House occurs during the early morning during the summer and equinox periods, however the majority of the additional shadow falls within the hard paved area of Wynyard Park. Refer to Section 2.3 of PPR.</p> <p>The future operation of Wynyard Car Park is not a matter for the Concept Plan. It is noted that Transport NSW have indicated that in the longer term the public car park may close and the tunnels be used for rail infrastructure purposes.</p> |
|   | MemoCorp Australia – owner of 11-31 York Street, Sydney                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
| 1 | <p>Objection to the proposed Concept Plan of the following grounds:</p> <p>Excessive bulk and scale and non-compliance with FSR.</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | <p>The FSR calculations for the site are based on the development site, consistent with the definitions in the Sydney LEP.</p> <p>The Concept Plan is seeking approval for the key parameters of the proposed development and building envelopes. The detailed building design will be documented in a future Project</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                 |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                    |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                             |
|---|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                    | Application.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                |
| 2 | The height of the tower is not in keeping with the scale around Wynyard Park and breeches the Carrington Street Height limit. The building setbacks in the Sydney DCP have not been complied with. | The proposed concept plan envelope is within the height limit for George Street, and is 98 metres below the maximum height limit permitted on the site. It also fully complies with the Martin Place Sun Access Plane height control. However, as documented in the original EAR, it does exceed the Carrington Street height limit, which is effectively 45m. The variation to the Carrington Street height limit and justification for the departure has been detailed in the EAR report and further urban design analysis is included at Section 2.5 of the PPR.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |
| 3 | Overshadowing impacts to Wynyard Park and Railway House.                                                                                                                                           | <p>Further analysis of the overshadowing impacts has been undertaken by Whelan Insites.</p> <p>The further analysis confirms the assessment presented in the original EAR that the proposed building envelope does not result in any additional overshadowing to Wynyard Park during the key midday-2pm period during winter. Minor additional overshadowing of the Park and Railway House occurs during the early morning during the summer and equinox periods, however the majority of the additional shadow falls within the hard paved area of Wynyard Park. Refer to Section 2.3 of PPR and Appendix E for detailed analysis.</p> <p>The further overshadowing analysis also confirms that there is minimal difference in overshadowing impact arising as a consequence of the non compliance with the Carrington Street setbacks, as compared to a scheme that complied with the setback requirement.</p> <p>The proposed development complies with the existing solar access requirements to Wynyard Park included in LEP 2005.</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                 |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                      |
|---|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| 4 | Impact of the proposed development on Shell House.                                                                              | A Heritage Impact Assessment was prepared and included with the EAR. The Heritage Listed facade of the building is being retained as recommended in that assessment. Further consideration of heritage impacts will be required at the time of detailed design proposals being made in relation to the built form. Refer to Statement of Commitment 26.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
| 5 | A design competition should be undertaken for the tower design.                                                                 | The EAR provided detailed information on the design development of the tower and station and justification for not seeking a design competition. Thakral does not propose to enter into a design competition for the site. An alternative proposal has been made in relation to a Design Review Panel.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                               |
| 6 | Additional information on the scope and extent of Wynyard Station upgrade works (west of Carrington Street) should be provided. | <p>The Concept Plan is seeking approval for the key parameters of the proposed development and building envelopes. Detailed design of the building, station access east of Carrington Street and the station design west of Carrington Street will be the subject of future development applications.</p> <p>The scope and extent of Wynyard Station upgrade works west of Carrington Street is not provided at this stage of the planning process. This is a matter for resolution by Transport NSW at the next stages of the project.</p>                                                                                          |
| 7 | The proposed number of car parking spaces should be reduced to 21 car parking spaces.                                           | <p>The basis of the recommendation to provide 21 car parking spaces is not clear.</p> <p>The amended Concept Plan proposal presented in the PPR proposes no net increase in existing on site parking. Thakral is proposing to reallocate 177 of the existing public car parking spaces provided in the on site public car park (which is currently managed by Thakral) to commercial tenant parking for the CityOne development. This will ensure that there is no net increase in parking on the site / in the precinct. Refer to Section 2.6 of the PPR, and to the updated Traffic and Parking Report included at Appendix D.</p> |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|---|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              | Thakral also acknowledges that RailCorp may in the longer term use the former tram tunnels for rail infrastructure purposes and that if RailCorp were to terminate Thakral's existing lease over the former tram tunnels, there would therefore be a further reduction in car parking spaces in the precinct arising as a consequence of the removal of existing public parking within these tunnels.                                                                                 |
| 8 | A detailed Construction Environmental Management Plan should be prepared. Dilapidation reports should also be prepared for Railway House and Transport House.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                | The Construction Methodology submitted with the EAR was provided to demonstrate that the proposed development could be constructed whilst maintaining access to the Station.<br><br>A detailed Construction and Environmental Management Plan will be prepared and submitted with the future Project Applications                                                                                                                                                                     |
| 9 | The public benefits need to be justified and the Contribution Offer should be more detailed                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  | Section 2.1 of the PPR details the public benefits of the proposed development. In addition Thakral proposed to enter into a Project Delivery Agreement with Transport NSW/RailCorp. The PDA will detail the proposed public infrastructure works to be undertaken by Thakral on land east of Carrington Street, economic benefits to be achieved and a monetary contribution towards Wynyard Station upgrades west of Carrington Street.                                             |
|   | 60 Margaret Street                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
| 1 | <p>The owners of 60 Margaret Street, Sydney objected to the Concept Plan and have raised the following concerns:</p> <p>The Wynyard Station access point into the Metcentre is the busiest access point into the Metcentre. Access from the station into the Metcentre is of critical importance for the owners and they have sought the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ That access to the Metcentre is not temporarily or permanently closed during construction and/or</li> </ul> | <p>Thakral acknowledges the construction management issues raised. All of these matters are both relevant and appropriate for resolution as part of the staging proposals and construction / demolition methodology to be incorporated in the future detailed Project Application(s).</p> <p>A detailed Construction and Environmental Management Plan will be prepared and submitted with the future Project Application(s). The CEMP will detail pedestrian access arrangements</p> |

## MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

### RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                   |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
|---|-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|   | <p>demolition activities;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Appropriate signage during construction clearly indicating pedestrian access to the Metcentre is provided;</li> <li>▪ Construction activities are to minimise impacts on pedestrians using the Metcentre link during peak times</li> </ul> | <p>during construction works and will identify appropriate staging, methodology and management requirements to ensure that access to relevant adjoining development is maintained during construction. This requirement is incorporated into the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Commitment 16).</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                            |
| 2 | <p>Any construction activities in the vicinity of Carrington Street would need to consider the impact on the structural integrity of the Metcentre.</p>                                                                                                                                                           | <p>No physical works are proposed as part of the Concept Plan, and approval of the Concept Plan will not allow for any works to commence without a further planning approval.</p> <p>Thakral acknowledges the issue raised, and is committed to preparation of a dilapidation survey prior to the commencement of any works. Notwithstanding that this is a matter appropriately dealt with at Project Application stage, the commitment to prepare a dilapidation survey in relation to immediately adjoining buildings is incorporated into the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 21)</p> <p>The future Project Application will be accompanied by a structural engineering report that considers any potential impact of demolition or construction activities on the Metcentre. This requirement is incorporated into the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 20).</p> |
| 3 | <p>Wynyard Park serves as the evacuation point for tenants of 60 Margaret Street and this needs to be taken into account in any future works within the area.</p>                                                                                                                                                 | <p>The CEMP will take into account Wynyard Park's use as an evacuation point for the tenants of 60 Margaret Street. This requirement is incorporated into the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 16).</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                  |
| 4 | <p>Provision should be made during construction activities to prevent the emission of dust and other activities that may potentially impact on food and retail outlets in the Metcentre</p>                                                                                                                       | <p>A detailed CEMP will be prepared and submitted with the relevant future application. The CEMP include noise and dust management measures. This requirement is incorporated into the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 16).</p>                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                         |

## MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

### RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



|  |                                                                                                                                                        |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                              |
|--|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
|  | The Construction Traffic Management Plan should consider impacts on Margaret Street, especially at the intersection of Carrington and Margaret Street. | A Construction Traffic Management Plan will be prepared and submitted with the detailed Project Application to assess the traffic impact on Margaret Street, including the intersection of Carrington and Margaret Street. This requirement is incorporated into the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 16). |
|  | Access and use of the Metcentre grease trap facility located on SRA land must not be compromised during any works undertaken.                          | A detailed CEMP will be prepared and submitted with the relevant future application. This requirement is incorporated into the revised Statement of Commitments (refer to Statement of Commitment 16).                                                                                                                                       |

# MP 09\_0076 CITYONE CONCEPT PLAN

## RESPONSE TO PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS



| GENERAL PUBLIC SUBMISSIONS |                                                                                                                                                                                                           |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
|----------------------------|-----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------|
| Key Issues Raised          |                                                                                                                                                                                                           | Thakral Response                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                       |
|                            | <b>Submissions supporting the proposal</b>                                                                                                                                                                |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 1                          | 24 submissions from the general public supporting the proposal. The majority of submissions however considered the proposed building envelope too short and thought a taller building should be proposed. | Noted. The height of the proposed building is limited by the Sun access controls in the Sydney LEP and the requirement not to cast an additional shadow over the facade of the GPO building.                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                           |
|                            | <b>Submissions objecting to the proposal</b>                                                                                                                                                              |                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                                        |
| 2                          | One submission from the general public did not support the proposal on the grounds that the scale of the development was excessive and did not complement Wynyard Park or the surrounding buildings.      | Additional urban design analysis and justification for the proposed envelope has been undertaken by Hassell and is detailed at Section 2.5 of the PPR. The PPR presents an amended Concept Plan building envelope that has sought to respond to issues raised with respect to presentation to Carrington Street by incorporating a 6m setback from Shell House. In addition there will be 3.5m setback on Carrington Street between RL56m and RL 63.6m |