MP10_0070 MOD 1: Modification request for Sydney Adventist Hospital, Wahroonga. Ku-ring-gai Council Comment

Council's previous submissions on this development raised concerns regarding the long term impacts of the carparking solutions for this development. In particular the provision of above-ground parking, surface and multi-storey, to the north of the site on prime potential recreation grounds that are adjoining and upland of bushland and riparian areas, and visible from the residential areas across the valley.

These concerns still stand and are highlighted by this application which seeks to make modifications to the northern carparks which exacerbate the issues Council has regarding the conflict between this hospital having a historical setting in a bushland and garden setting and a design that places carparking in locations that destroy this significance and alienate this aspect from the hospital clinic buildings.

The greatest concern regarding this modification is the new design and position of the northern multi-deck carpark which now essentially forms the entry to the main hospital building. Its increased bulk, scale, proximity and connection to the main building are considered inappropriate and detrimental to the hospital's main entry both visually and experientially in terms of amenity. The redesign has removed key elements that are fundamental to the hospital building's main entry, and which provided already limited preservation of key aspects of the northerly orientation (solar and visual) of the new main hospital building and entry point.

Given that the Department has approved the original application, Council requests that our concerns are now heeded and that the recommendations below are reflected in your consideration of these modifications.

Response to modifications:

- 1) A revised layout for the approved temporary car park;
 - No objections in principal to this modification.
 - Conditions should include the following points:
 - The extent of the carpark works will not exceed the existing footprint of the carpark on its northern (adjacent to the bushland/riparian lands) boundary.
 - There will be no further encroachment on those lands to the northern boundary in terms of works, storm water and construction material/spillage.
 - A date be specified (to coincide with the completion of the multi-deck car park) to cease the use of the temporary carpark.

- Documentation and plans be submitted to show the restoration works and use intended for the carpark area once it ceases to be a temporary carpark.
- That access ways through the carpark for bushfire services be clearly indicated as in the original approval.
- 2) Alteration to the layout of a permanent at grade car park and a new permanent at grade car park;
 - No objections in principal to this modification.
 - Conditions should include the following points:
 - A landscape drawing of the new 24 space carpark be submitted specifying planting of 8 mature trees to replace those being removed to accommodate this parking area.
 - A detailed drawing be provided to show access, location and configuration of the new 60 space carpark including landscape bays as in the existing adjacent carpark.
 - The 60 space carpark be designed so as not to encroach on the bushland to the eastern boundary.
 - That access ways through the carpark for bushfire services be clearly indicated as in the original approval.
- A minor alteration to the approved location and internal flow of the multi-deck carpark (bringing the structure closer to the hospital wings and allowing pedestrian access at the one level); and

PLEASE REFER TO ATTACHMENTS 1,2,3,4,5 – mark ups of drawings

- Council strongly objects to this modification. The alterations to the multi-deck carpark are significant and cannot be considered as minor modifications.
- Council recommends that none of the changes to the multi-deck carpark be allowed and the original approved design be reinstated to retain the following key features:
 - That the arrival podium/entry laneway adjacent to the hospital clinic building and entry remains separated from the multi-deck carpark by a significant level change between it and the carpark as approved,
 - That solar access, planting and landscaping elements be retained between the multideck carpark and the main hospital building as approved
 - That the walkway/pergola adjacent to the hospital clinic building remains as approved,
 - That the Forecourt area to the east of the carpark building that provided a physical and visual link from the hospital entry to a sunny seating area with views to the bush and valley to the north be retained as approved,
 - That direct covered and linked access of the multi-deck carpark and the hospital building entry is provided only below the level 2 entry at ground level, maintaining

physical and visual separation of the multi-deck carpark and the main hospital building as approved.

- That the bulk, scale, façade treatment and levels remain as originally approved to preserve the amenity of the forecourt and the arrival podium and the hospital clinic building entry and internal spaces with outlook to the north.
- Explanation:

Council's original submission strongly objected to the provision of this above ground carparking station, requesting that it be placed underground under the new hospital buildings. The approved scheme argued that the multi-deck carpark would in no way detract from the sense of arrival at the hospital entry because of its setback, and that the open space between the carpark and the hospital clinic buildings would be well proportioned with landscaping, pergolad walkways, good sunlight access, all avoiding the space between the carpark and the hospital clinic building turning into a narrow, unpleasant, shaded, windy area that was simply a carparking area rather than an area that had a high level of amenity giving a good entry/gathering area at the front of this main entry.

The adjustments made to integrate the multi-deck carpark in the absence of it being located underground included:

- staggering the building levels to create a modulated elevational treatment and reducing height and bulk at the top level
- sinking the building into the ground to reduce its bulk and encroachment on the main entry building and its appearance from across the valley
- positioning the building so that it was disconnected from the main hospital entry building and did not read as part of the hospital entry upon approach to the main hospital entry point
- provision of landscape planting and elements in the separation area to reduce the carpark's dominance at the main hospital entry and at this northern location
- offsetting the carpark building location to allow vistas and direct visual and physical access to the important northern aspect from the main hospital building entry point, via the 'forecourt' area to the east of the carpark building
- locating the carpark at a distance to allow good solar access into the arrival podium/laneway at the front of the hospital building and entry
- locating the carpark at a distance so that it does not obstruct views and solar access of the main hospital building.

This modification application now seeks to remove those fundamental elements and revert to original schemes to which Council has already strongly objected to in previous submissions.

Council objects to the proposed modifications for the following reasons:

- Substantial changes to the bulk, scale and appearance of the multi-deck carpark:
 - the overall design of the building has been changed significantly moving away from a stepped modulated building to a solid standard rectangular form with no with no setbacks or modulations particularly at the upper level 5
 - The building is substantially altered in its configuration of parking no longer being housed on a series of split platforms
 - there is a significant alteration to the appearance of the multi-deck carpark with removal of original level changes which were integral to design having a reduced visual impact in the prominent location it occupies
 - there is substantial increase in the bulk and scale of the multi-deck carpark through an increase in height of at least 3.750m above that approved across the entire structure (refer to Table 1 below)
 - there is substantial increase in bulk and scale of the multi-deck carpark with its extension over, and removal of the open forecourt to the east of the carpark
 - there is substantial increase the bulk and scale of the building with the 3 storey overhang over the entry/arrival podium laneway
 - the new carpark proposal creates cumulative bulk by its close proximity to and its physical connection with the hospital clinic/entry building
 - the new carpark proposal detracts from the northern elevation of the hospital's main entry building and in effect forms part of the hospital's main entry building elevation by its lack of substantial separation, visual and physical separation
 - the proximity of the proposed modified carpark building with its 3 storey overhang and 3 storey connection with the hospital clinic building/main entry building makes it substantial enough to read as the entry to the main hospital
 - the new carpark in effect destroys all elements agreed in the original approval to create a good urban space and main entry to the hospital between the two buildings
- Loss of amenity, landscaping elements, solar access, aspect and urban spatial quality of the main hospital entry through the relocation and reconfiguration of the multi-deck carpark:
 - The overhang and reduction of distance from the main hospital building removes any possibility of landscaping in the area,

- The new positioning will overshadow the main hospital entry laneway removing any good aspect and solar access for the hospital building entry
- The positioning of the building closer to the existing hospital building has removed all landscaping elements that were provided along the carpark façade to reduce the bulk of the building and to soften the appearance of the carpark at tis main hospital entry point
- Similarly, the positioning of the building closer to the existing hospital building has removed all landscaping elements that were provided along the hospital clinic building façade, including the removal of the planted pergola walkway which was to give some quality to this entry podium area, and detract from the sense of stepping out into a carpark
- The proximity of the carpark and the overhang of the upper floors significantly alters the "arrival podium" level both visually and spatially through the new bulk, and in terms of significant reduction of natural light into the entry area, destroying any sense of quality of the hospital's main entrance, rather creating an entry based around the carpark
- Raising the level of the new Level 2 to the Arrival podium level and merging the multideck carpark with the arrival podium carpark destroys the key feature of entry and arrival tat the hospital main entry. The main entry experience has now been reduced to driving into an undercover carparking block
- The Forecourt to the east of the multi-deck carpark has been replaced by carpark building. This forecourt was an important element providing physical and visual access to the important northern valley/bush views. (Council in its original submission opposed this location for the multi-deck parking because of loss of views to this aspect from the hospital whose historical origin lies in the hospital being located in a bushland setting)This forecourt was a means to preserve that aspect at least to the main entry of the hospital.

Existing Approval	Modification Application
The approved multi-deck carpark is a	The proposed modification removes the
building with split parking levels –	split parking level system integral to the
presenting with less bulk and mass and	original approved application; it increases
reduced overall height of the carpark.	the parking and bulk of the top level of the
	carpark building and removes an entire
	below ground floor of parking; it raises the
	overall level of the building above that

Table 1 – Alterations to Levels of the Modified Multi-Deck carpark

MP10_0070 MOD 1: Modification request for Sydney Adventist Hospital, Wahroonga.

Ku-ring-gai Council Comment

		approved.	
Level 5	none	Level 5	174.950
 this is a half size level 		- overhangs the 'arrival	
with parking on the lower		podium' - extra floor space	
split only		has been added to	
Level 5	171.200	substantially increase the	
 lower split only 		parking spaces on this top	
		floor, making it one large	
		flat parking level	
Level 4	169.800	Level 4	172.000
– upper split		 overhangs the 'arrival 	
Level 4	168.400	podium' - There is no split	
 lower split 		of the floor, it is now one	
		large flat parking level	
Level 3	167.000	Level 3	169.250
– upper split		 overhangs the 'arrival 	
Level 3	165.600	podium' - There is no split	
– lower split		of the floor, it is now one	
		large flat parking level	
Level 2	164.200	Level 2a	166.500
– upper split		- This is a half size floor	
		set back to allow clearance	
		of cars on the 'arrival	
		podium'	
Level 2	162.800	Level 2	163.650
– lower split		 This has been altered 	(163.750 is
		now to be almost the same	the level of
		as the level of the arrival	the Arrival
		podium – previously the	Podium – a
		arrival podium, with its very	difference of
		limited short term parking	100mm)
		bays, was separated from	
		the level 2 carpark by a	
		level change and provision	
		of landscaping between	
		the two -	
Level 1	161.400	Level 1	160.750

MP10_0070 MOD 1: Modification request for Sydney Adventist Hospital, Wahroonga.

Ku-ring-gai Council Comment

– upper split		- There is no split of the	
Level 1	160.00	floor, it is now one large	
– lower split		flat parking level	
Level 0	158.600	Level 0	
– upper split		 this level has been 	
Level 0	157.200	removed and is the	
– lower split		primary reason that the	
		overall building height has	
		been increased by a	
		minimum of 3.750m	

4) A revised entry building to better integrate various aspects of the project. The revised entry building is critical for patient and visitor flows from the multi-deck parking area to the existing hospital and new CSB.

PLEASE REFER TO ATTACHMENT 6 - mark ups of drawings

- Council objects to certain aspects of this modification to the hospital entry which compromise the amenity and visual character of the main entry point of the hospital.
- The original approved design was an open walkway with generous proportions and visual links to the northern valley views. The proposed modifications to the entry building constitute a significant alteration to the design, appearance and flow of the entry into the hospital and do not enhance the quality of the hospital main entry.
- This modification completely changes and diminishes the entry point to the hospital buildings whilst Council can agree to the enclosure of the previously open entry area off the arrival podium, it is recommended that the following conditions be included to preserve the amenity and visual significance of this main hospital entry point:
 - That the entry building in no way be connected to the multi-deck carpark above ground level as in the approved design.
 - That the protrusion that is the new entry building removes visual blocks (place lifts and stairs that require solid facades further into the building) to preserve the visual transparency into and out of the entry from all sides it is viewed from as provided in the approved design.
 - That the information/reception desk is located at the entry
 - That the views, vistas to the north and direct physical access to open rest/recreation and outdoor seating area to the north forecourt be retained as approved
 - That solar access into the entry foyer area and its external surrounding drop off and pedestrian areas be preserved as approved.







IN U U L L	STAG	E 1 REDEV	STAGE 1 REDEVELOPMENT				
M Constanting Street System NSM Averagin 2000 as Sold Systems NSM 2001	N.	OWNER IT LATE	LAN .	£	a s	Disassi water	1554
and have been been and the best set where the been been to be the top of the best better to be the best best best better to be the best best best best best best best bes	1200	9 8	1265/2011	2	11100	11100 B-A-113	[03]









AUSELL	STAG	E 1 REDEV	STORET ADVENTIST HOSPITAL	MULTIDE	MULTIDECK LEVEL 4	
III Currentinos Devis System NSM Australia 2000 x 3487 System NSM 2001	SOLE	THE MANNE	CATE IN	te s	NAME & COMPANY	NSA
1117 Diel werdsteel sen an Lee Insere Despr. Lanceuse Architecture Planning Uniter Despr. 4 000	ŝ	6	12042011 CM	11100	R.A.115	IFUI
PR Dara hang tang turi Jingapan Praters	1001	٩	THE ROLE AND DESCRIPTION OF A DESCRIPTIO	11100	11100 D-M-110	[co]



3



ADDALED LVL S

ray architects		
MUL Floor 1200 (h h o h h h h	
1407/2010 A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A A	i the state of the state	



A Construction of the second s	(E)		
SYDNEY ADV STAGE 1 RED STAGE 1 RED 1 200 gr 16		EI	
SYDNEY ADVENTIST HOSPITAL STAGE I REDEVELOPMENT sau and tablet 1200 and tablet	(B)		
или	(¥)		
[03]		(B) (B)	



M

Ø:

ALL WORK

VV5 GWS

Paga

12.07.10 08.07.10 07.07.10 24.06.10

EA Submission Presentation to SAH Information Information

8











NBOT	4 Gamy Bray 3055 1000	[E] info@mornstrey.com.au [W] www.mornstrey.com.au [V] www.mornstrey.com.au	F + 512 9439 0522		
DEAMING NUMBER	1 A/EA-078	@A1	al (1-0 Jacobe Briane)	MULTI-DECK CARPARK SECTIONS (1)	
Trans.	A	4/11/2010	PLOT DATE		

		-

CARPARK

					Γ
10	11	z	ы	2	ß

CARPARK



Markan Manual 1 ESCALOR Markan Manual Calond Umanual Colong 21 ESTINE Mail Statistical Statistica	34 FANDE DOLWS 35 FANDE DOLWS 36 FANDE DOC 37 HEADE DOC 38 SASEWORD 38 SASEWORD
11 FALLER 12 FALLER 13 FALLER 14 FALLER 15 FALLER 15 FALLER 16 FALLER 16 FALLER 17 FALLER 17 FALLER 18 FALLER 19 FALLER 19 FALLER 19 FALLER 10 FALLER	33 CHAPEL WILLS 34 FEATURE COLUMNS 35 FEATURE ROOF 36 FEATURE ROOF 37 HWADRALL
26 21 ESCATOR BOOR 27 22 22 22 22 22 22 22 22 22 22 22 22 2	37 FEATURE COLUMNS 36 GLAZED ROOF 36 FEATURE ROOF
31 ESCULATOR 32 FEATURE WALL 34 FEATURE COLUMNS 35 GLAVED ROOF	32 CHAPEL WALLS 34 FEATURE COLUMNS 35 CLAZED ROOF
31 ESCULATOR 32 FEATURE WALL 33 CHAPEL WALLS 34 FEATURE COLUMNS	33 CHAPEL WALLS 34 FEATURE COLUMNS
31 ESCALATOR 32 FEATURE WALL CHAPTER MALLS	
31 ESCALATOR	
31 ESCALATOR	FEATURE MALL



B Constants Direct Network 2000 a (Add Direc NGR 2000) 1917 2000 war-brand Lorison 1917 2000 war-brand Lorison Manager Protect 1917 Direct Yang Long SAN Directory Protect	ASSELL	~	? ENTR	Y PACE	month
SAL SHART ON UNIVERSITY OF UNIVERSI OF UNIVERSITY OF UNIVERSITY OF UNIVERSITY OF UNIVERSITY OF UNIVE	SYDNEY ADVENTIST HOSPITAL STAGE 1 REDEVELOPMENT		17 FO	TNI AS	
. 11100 B-A-141	SECTIONS 2		3	С	5 3 5



NIA









